

Committee of the Whole Meeting Agenda

Monday, November 6, 2023, 6:30 p.m. S.H. Blake Memorial Auditorium

1. Closed Session

Closed Session Agendas will be distributed separately to Members of Council and EMT only.

2. Open Session (Operations) Chair: Councillor Trevor Giertuga

3. Disclosures of Interest

4. Confirmation of Agenda

WITH RESPECT to the November 6, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

5. Presentations

	5.1	ORC Monthly Award Presentations Memorandum from City Clerk Krista Power, dated October 26, 2023 requesting to provide a presentation relative to the above noted.	5
	5.2	2023 Mayor's Community Safety Awards Memorandum from Community Safety and Well-being Specialist Lee-Ann Chevrette, dated August 25, 2023 requesting to provide a presentation relative to the above noted.	6
6.	Items /	Arising from Closed Session	
7.	Report	ts of Committees, Boards and Outside Agencies	
	7.1	Earthcare Advisory Committee Minutes Minutes of Meeting 05-2023 of the Earthcare Advisory Committee held on September 5, 2023, for information.	7 - 12
	7.2	Waterfront Development Committee Minutes	13 - 17

Pages

Minutes of Meeting 03-2023 of the Waterfront Development Committee held on September 19, 2023, for information.

8. Reports of Municipal Officers

8.1	Climate Adaptation Update 2023 Report 321-2023 (Infrastructure, Development & Operations) relative to the above noted, for information.	18 - 27
	Memorandum from Climate Adaptation Coordinator Jacob Porter, dated October 23, 2023 requesting to provide a presentation relative to the above noted.	
8.2	Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRRAP) Report 333-2023 (Infrastructure, Development & Operations) recommending that a Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRAPP) be developed to meet the City's requirements under Ontario Regulation 25/23: Broader Public Sector: Energy Reporting and Conservation and Demand Management Plans. WITH RESPECT to Report 333-2023, Infrastructure, Development and Operations Capital Eacility Construction, we recommond that a	28 - 31
	Operations– Capital Facility Construction, we recommend that a Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRAPP) be developed to meet the City's requirements under Ontario Regulation 25/23: Broader Public Sector: Energy Reporting and Conservation and Demand Management Plans;	
	AND THAT Appropriation #16 be approved;	
	AND THAT any relevant agreements be executed by the General Manager Infrastructure, Development & Operations;	
	AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.	
Outst	anding Items	
9.1	Outstanding Items List for Operations as of October 24, 2023 Memorandum from City Clerk Krista Power, dated October 24, 2023 relative to the above noted, for information.	32 - 33
Open	Session (Community Services)	

Chair: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng

9.

10.

11. Reports of Committees, Boards and Outside Agencies

	11.1	2024 Ontario Winter Games Committee Minutes Minutes of Meeting 08-2023 of the Ontario Winter Games Committee held on September 14, 2023, for information.	34 - 44
	11.2	District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board Minutes Minutes of Meeting 14/2023 and 15/2023 (Closed), held on September 21, 2023, for information.	45 - 60
12.	Report	ts of Municipal Officers	
	12.1	Fort William Gardens Improvements Report 350/2023 (Community Services) relative to the above noted. (Distributed Separately)	
		Pending the passage of the resolution at the Committee of the Whole meeting, the resolution will be presented for ratification at the City Council meeting to be held later in the evening and will require a two-thirds vote.	
	12.2	Soccer Northwest Ontario – Multi-Use Indoor Sports Facility Concept – Financing Strategy At the September 11, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, a resolution was passed recommending that Council confirm the city- owned lands/park lands west of the Thunder Bay Community Auditorium as the preferred site for a proposed multi-use indoor turf facility to respond to the community's need for indoor turf, and that Administration proceed to develop a proposed financing strategy to support a Request for Proposal to solicit interest from potential interested proponents to offer services to advance the realization of the SNO Option (CTB Facility Design Standard), as outlined in Scenario 3 of Report 254-2023 with a report back date of November 6, 2023.	61 - 68
		Report 335-2023 (Corporate Services) recommending that the financing strategy to support the multi-use indoor sports facility concept, as	

strategy to support the multi-use indoor sports facility concept, as proposed by Soccer Northwest Ontario (with City of Thunder Bay Facility Design Standard), be approved as outlined in this report.

WITH RESPECT to Report 335-2023 Corporate Services, we recommend that the financing strategy to support the multi-use indoor sports facility concept, as proposed by Soccer Northwest Ontario (with City of Thunder Bay Facility Design Standard), be approved as outlined in this report;

AND THAT City Council approve the use of the Negotiation Method pursuant to section 4.09 of Corporate By-law 113-2011 (Supply Management) to engage Stantec Architecture Ltd. to consult on necessary studies and preliminary design;

AND THAT Administration report back in the first quarter 2024 with the results of these studies, a recommended project delivery approach, and the results of public engagement prior to commencement of a competitive procurement process;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

12.3 Budget Variance Report #3 Report 313-2023 (Corporate Services-Office of the City Treasurer) (Distributed separately)

13. Petitions and Communications

13.1 Receipt of Report from Integrity Commissioner

Memorandum from City Clerk Krista Power, dated October 30, 2023 containing a recommendation relative to the above noted.

WITH RESPECT to the Integrity Commissioner report presented on November 6, 2023 relating to the conduct of Councillor Agarwal, we recommend that the sanction contained within the report be approved;

AND THAT Councillor Agarwal's pay be suspended for a period of 30 days (2 pay periods) commencing with the next pay period;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to Council for ratification.

13.2Update - Jumbo Gardens Community Centre81 - 82Memorandum from Director - Recreation & Culture Leah Prentice dated
October 25, 2023 relative to the above noted, for information.81 - 82

14. Outstanding Items

- 14.1Outstanding Items List for Community Services as of October 24, 202383 84Memorandum from City Clerk Krista Power, dated October 24, 2023relative to the above noted, for information.
- 15. New Business
- 16. Adjournment

69 - 80



Memorandum

Office of the City Clerk Fax: 623-5468 Telephone: 625-2230

TO: Members of City Council

FROM: Krista Power, City Clerk

DATE: October 26, 2023

SUBJECT: Monthly Awards – Citizens of Outstanding Achievement Committee of the Whole – November 6, 2023

Please be advised that Citizens of Outstanding Achievement Monthly Awards will be presented at the November 6, 2023, Committee of the Whole meeting to the following:

Chelsea Opperman will be presented a certificate under the category of Community Champion for their efforts as founder and President of the Lakehead University Philanthropic Association, and for organization of period product drives throughout the City of Thunder Bay.

Thunder Bay Chill U17 Boys will be presented a certificate under the category of Sports Achievement for their victory at the 2023 USA Cup International Soccer Tournament on July 16, 2023.





MEMORANDUM

TO:	Krista Power, City Clerk
FROM:	Lee-Ann Chevrette, CSWB Specialist – Community Safety & Well-Being Thunder Bay
DATE:	August 25, 2023

RE: 2023 Mayor's Community Safety Awards

Please be advised that we would like to request presentation of the annual Mayor's Community Safety Awards at the beginning of the Committee of the Whole meeting on Monday November 6, 2023, at 6:30 p.m. in the S.H. Blake Memorial Auditorium.

These awards, presented annually by Community Safety & Well-Being (CSWB) Thunder Bay, are presented in recognition of the individuals and groups making significant contributions to safety and well-being in Thunder Bay.

If possible, the awards will be presented in person, and short video clips and a program will highlight the contributions of each award recipient. As well, we will distribute a media release and post the videos to the website at <u>thunderbay.ca/cswb</u>.

The Awards to be presented that evening include:

- One Community Hero Award
- One Young Leader Award
- Up to four Outstanding Community Project Awards

The order of the program will be as follows:

Introduction and overview of Awards by A/Director of Strategic Initiatives & Engagement, Cynthia Olsen Acting Mayor Remarks by Chair of the CSWB Thunder Bay, Jeff Upton Presentation of Awards by CSWB Specialist, Lee-Ann Chevrette

Copy to: Lee-Ann Chevrette, CSWB Specialist – Community Safety & Well-Being Thunder Bay Cynthia Olsen, Acting Director, Strategic Initiatives & Engagement Stacey Levanen, Supervisor, Corporate Communications and Community Engagement



EarthCare Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, September 5, 2023, 4:01 p.m. McNaughton Room - 3rd Floor, City Hall

1. EarthCare Advisory Committee Meeting 05-2023

Chair: Councillor Andrew Foulds

2. Members

Councillor Andrew Foulds Shannon Costigan Kiera Essex Taylor Munro Jane Todd Sandra Stiles

3. Officials

Michelle Warywoda, Director - Environment Division Summer Stevenson, Sustainability Coordinator Jacob Porter, Climate Adaptation Coordinator Lori Wiitala, Committee Clerk/Legislative Specialist

4. Guests

Alain Joseph, Acting Manager - Indigenous Relations Office

5. Welcome and Disclosures of Interest

The Chair called the meeting to order. There were no disclosures of interest declared.

6. Agenda Approval

MOVED BY: Kiera Essex SECONDED BY: Taylor Munro

WITH RESPECT to the September 5, 2023, meeting of the EarthCare Advisory Committee, we recommend that the agenda as amended, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

CARRIED

7. Confirmation of Previous Minutes

The Minutes of Meeting 03-2023 and 04-2023 of the EarthCare Advisory Committee, held on April 19, 2023 and May 31, 2023, respectively, be confirmed.

MOVED BY: Taylor Munro SECONDED BY: Kiera Essex

THAT the Minutes of Meeting 03-2023 and 04-2023 of the EarthCare Advisory Committee, held on April 19, 2023 and May 31, 2023, respectively, be confirmed.

CARRIED

8. Indigenous Relations Office Presentation

Alain Joseph, Acting Manager - Indigenous Relations Office provided information relative to the above noted.

Discussion was held relative to the Land Acknowledgement in the draft Terms of Reference and connecting the Indigenous Advisory Committee with EarthCare Advisory Committee to share knowledge and teachings, with the goal to explore opportunities for collaboration going forward. A workshop to discuss and understand the meaning behind a land acknowledgement was recommended as the first step.

Discussion was held regarding EarthCare Advisory Committee changing their name to a traditional Anishinaabemowin name, and how they would work towards receiving this gift. It was recommended to build relationships and focus

on Indigenous centered work.

9. Business Arising from Previous Minutes

9.1 Terms of Reference

A discussion was held relative to the above noted, a draft copy of the revised Committee Terms of Reference provided, for information; it was recommended to defer this item to the October meeting.

9.2 Multi Use Turf Facility Discussion

Discussion was held and the committee was concerned that the city's commitment to the Net Zero Strategy is not reflected within the recommendations for the proposed Multi Use Turf Facility, and the following motion was passed relative to the above noted.

MOVED BY:Taylor MunroSECONDED BY:Kiera Essex

WITH RESPECT to the Soccer Northwest Ontario (SNO) Turf Facility Concept – Review Update report being presented to Committee of the Whole on September 11, 2023;

THAT the EarthCare Advisory Committee send a memorandum to City Council building on the memorandum to Council from the Committee in 2019 and subsequently the declaration of a climate emergency and the commitment to net-zero;

AND THAT the EarthCare Advisory Committee recommend that any proposed financing strategy reflect the above initiatives and commitments.

CARRIED

10. Net-Zero Strategy, Sustainability and Working Group Update

Summer Stevenson provided the following update relative to the above noted.

- 1. LEAD: Provide civic leadership to advance mutual respect, equal opportunity and hope.
 - 1. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reporting

- 1. 2021 GHG Inventory Report is complete. Item to be included on the next meeting agenda and included in the annual report to Council (tentative date: October 30, 2023).
- 2. Submitted carbon disclosure to CDP and Global Covenant of Mayors in July.

2. Integrating Climate Change Considerations

1. Continuing to provide feedback during the Strategic Planning process. Will be participating in three full-day planning sessions this month.

3. Corporate Transition

1. Officially moved into the Strategic Initiatives & Engagement Office in City Hall.

4. Phase 2: Home Energy Improvement Loan Program Design

 Prepared Terms of Reference and Evaluation Criteria. RFP creation is underway – aiming to have a consultant in place by the end of October.

5. SERVE: Advance service excellence through a citizen focus and best use of technology.

- 1. Pollinator Signs Clean, Green & Beautiful Funding
 - 21. Three new pollinator signs were installed on July 12 at Hillcrest Park, Chapples Golf Course Clubhouse, and the Baggage Building. Funding wrap-up report was submitted to the Clean, Green & Beautiful Committee on July 21.

2. Seabin – Great Lakes Plastic Cleanup Initiative

21. Worked with Confederation College's Applied Research & Innovation program to repair broken Seabin. The unit was repaired and installed at the marina late July. Data collection began in August with waste characterization being conducted by Lakehead University.

3. EV Show 2023

21. Small sponsorship and supporting role in this year's show. Scheduled for September 23, 2023, at the CLE Coliseum. Synergy North is the title sponsor of this event.

4. EcoArt Day 2023 – Clean, Green & Beautiful Funding

21. Received \$4,000 from Clean, Green & Beautiful to host a collaborative art making event in partnership with EcoSuperior, Mindful Makers, CreAction Collective, and Club culturel francophone. Event will take place on October 14 at the Baggage Building during Ontario Culture Days.

5. Northwest Climate Hope & Action Gathering 2023

21. Gathering to take place on November 24 & 25 – collaborative event with many different community leaders to bring together folks on climate action. Supporting the Steering Committee and will be conducting a session on engaging with municipal climate action.

11. Climate Adaptation Update

Jacob Porter provided the following update relative to the above noted.

LEAD: Provide civic leadership to advance mutual respect, equal opportunity and hope.

- UN-Habitat SDG project featuring Thunder Bay efforts on SDG goals completed; to be featured with various other Canadian municipalities in UN report
- Public works day is September 23

SERVE: Advance service excellence through a citizen focus and best use of technology

- Climate risk vulnerability assessment with Thunder Bay District Health Unit underway
 - Information will be used in renewal of Climate Adaptation Strategy and future TBDHU climate action plan
 - Workshop September 19th with representatives from organizations across the district
 - Will be pursuing follow up with various organizations based on results

GROW: Focus on city building and social infrastructure to strengthen our economy, lifestyle and well-being

5

- We have also been selected as a host site for the 2024 provincial priority emergency exercise, focused on extreme heat, and I am the Thunder Bay lead on that project.
 - Will take place May 5-7, 2024 (emergency preparedness week)

RENEW: Focus on essential infrastructure, revitalize our cores and enhance our Image Routes

• Risk assessment for all asset classes is underway as part of the asset management plan

12. Upcoming Events

Summer Stevenson provided the following upcoming events.

The EV Show 2023 - Saturday, September 23, 2023 Public Works Day - Saturday, September 23, 2023

13. New Business

14. Next Meeting

The EarthCare Advisory Committee Meetings will be held the 3rd Wednesday of each month with the exception of July and August, in the McNaughton Room, at 4:00 p.m., unless otherwise noted, as follows:

- Wednesday, October 18, 2023
- Wednesday, November 15, 2023
- Wednesday, December 20, 2023

15. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:28 p.m.



Waterfront Development Committee Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, September 19, 2023, 4:03 p.m. McNaughton Room - 3rd Floor, City Hall

1. Waterfront Development Committee Meeting 03-2023

Chair: Councillor Andrew Foulds

2. Members

Roderick Bosch Brad DesRochers Councillor Andrew Foulds Timothy Hardie Warren Philp Sean Spenrath Councillor Michael Zussino

3. Officials

Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure, Development & Operations Kayla Dixon, Director of Engineering – Infrastructure, Development & Operations Flo-Ann Track, Council & Committee Clerk

4. Guests

Darrik Smith, Mobility Coordinator - Infrastructure, Development & Operations

5. Disclosures

None

6. Agenda Approval

MOVED BY: Sean Spenrath SECONDED BY: Councillor Michael Zussino

WITH RESPECT to the September 19, 2023 meeting of the Waterfront Development Committee, we recommend that the Agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business be confirmed.

CARRIED

7. Committee Work Plan - Action Items

At the June 7, 2023 meeting of the Waterfront Development Committee a consensus workshop was held to determine high-level categories to advise the focus of the work plan.

Darrik Smith, Mobility Coordinator - Infrastructure, Development & Operations facilitated a consensus workshop relative to the above noted.

The goal for the Committee to answer the following question, below, and determine actionable items for the work plan:

"What are some actions this Committee can take to make progress on the themes?"

The results of the workshop are included in Attachment A.

The next steps will be to action the items identified in the Work Plan.

It was the consensus of the Committee that Stakeholder groups be invited to future meetings to help inform the Work Plan.

8. Minutes of Previous Meeting

MOVED BY: Roderick Bosch SECONDED BY: Councillor Michael Zussino

THAT the Minutes of Meeting 02-2023 Waterfront Development Committee, held on June 7, 2023 be confirmed.

CARRIED

9. Terms of Reference

At the June 5, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting a resolution was passed amending the Terms of Reference for the Waterfront Development Committee to remove the position of Mayor (ex-officio) from the committees' composition.

Amended Waterfront Development Committee Terms of Reference, for information.

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:46 pm.

Waterfront Development Committee Action Planning Brainstorm

Themes

Interpretation of the table produced three major themes based on the number of votes across the dotocracy.

Theme 1: Education & Partnerships

There was also a strong desire for the committee to be educated on happenings in and around the Waterfront along with wanting to partner with organizations involved with that area. Education and Presentations for WDC received four (4) votes in "Foster Collaborative Relationships", specifically identifying CEDC, Port Authority and/or Chamber of Commerce receiving five (5) votes. Additionally, under "Cultivate Sustainable Development" getting an update on the Infrastructure Status of the Waterfront from Administration received three (3) votes. The total for this theme would be twelve (12) total votes.

Theme 2: Master Planning Process

The committee being active voices in the Waterfront Master Planning process emerged as a popular theme across "Engage in Strategic Direction". Being Full and Active Participants in the process received eight (8) votes, monitoring and reviewing the master plan received one (1) vote, building relationships to ensure master plan implementation received one (1) vote and documenting the strategic direction and ideas received two (2) votes. This brings the total Master Plan-Related votes to twelve (12).

Theme 3: Develop and Execute a Waterfront Engagement Plan

Developing and Executing a Waterfront Engagement Plan that identifies partnerships to leverage was also a popular theme across "Foster Collaborative Relationships" with a total of six (6) votes. Identifying Organizations to Partner With can also be considered as an element of an engagement Plan, which receive one (1) vote. Related elements can also be found in "Champion Superior Thunder Bay" with Communication and Promotion Plan receiving two (2) votes, and Support Events at Marina Park from "Facilitate Local/Cultural Experiences" receiving another (1) vote. This brings the thematic vote total to ten (10) votes.

Stand-Alone Items

Some stand-alone items had been identified outside the major themes, including:

- Develop an Extension to Central Avenue from "Cultivate Sustainable Development" received two (2) votes.
- Recommendation to Council Pedestrian Crossing of CPR, etc., which received three (3) votes.

	SHORT-TERM (3-6mo)	MEDIUM-TERM (1-2y)	BY END OF COMMITTEE TERM
FACILITATE LOCAL/CULTURAL EXPERIENCES	Support Events @ Marina Park (1 vote) More Plug-Ins For Food Trucks & Vendors (0 votes)	Develop a Plan for Use of Facilities (0 votes) Get Updated on Cultural Plan & ID Constraints (0 votes)	Implement Cultural Plan with Stakeholder & City Commitment (1 vote) Create Covered Pavilions To Be Used As Pop-Up Markets – Insurance + Rental Fees (1 vote)
FOSTER COLLABORATIVE RELATIONSHIPS	ID Organizations You Want To Partner With (1 vote) Education & Presentations for WDC (4 votes)	Develop and Execute an Engagement Plan (1 vote)	Engage With Organizations (0 votes) Foster Relationships With CEDC and Port Authority and/or Chamber of Commerce (5 votes)
CHAMPION SUPERIOR THUNDER BAY	Communication & Promotion Plan (2 votes)	ID Waterfront Service Gaps & Opportunities for Users (2 votes)	Create a Guide to User Experiences (0 votes) Seek Opportunities for Enhanced Recreational Entertainment (0 votes)
CULTIVATE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT	SUSTAINABLE ID Sites Across Waterfront		Develop the Areas & Trail (2 votes) Select Priorities and Implementation of Funding in Medium Term (0 votes)
ENGAGE IN STRATEGIC DIRECTION	Be Full and Active Participants in the Master Plan Process (8 votes)	Recommendation to Council – Ped Crossing of CPR, etc. (3 votes) Request Presentation of Major Projects (0 votes) Regularly Monitor and Review Master Plan (1 vote)	Facilitate Relationship Building to Ensure Implementation of the Master Plan (1 vote) Document the Strategic Direction and Ideas (2 votes)



REPORT NUMBER 321-2023-Infrastructure, Development & Operations-Engineering &							
Operations							
DATE							
PREPARED	October 16, 2023	FILE					
MEETING DATE	November 6, 2023						
SUBJECT	Climate Adaptation Update 2023						

RECOMMENDATION

For information.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Climate change is a significant threat for the City of Thunder Bay, and the threat continues to increase. Climate impacts include higher infrastructure costs; disrupted operations; aggravation of existing social issues; in addition to risks to the health, safety, and wellbeing of citizens.

The City of Thunder Bay Climate Adaptation Strategy: Climate-Ready City, is the municipality's guiding document for adapting to the impacts of climate change.

This Report provides an update on progress made in implementing the Strategy over the past year.

DISCUSSION

City Council declared a climate emergency on January 13, 2020, recognizing the urgent threat presented by the current and potential impacts of climate change. In the face of this challenge, the City of Thunder Bay recognizes the need for adaptation to reduce the unavoidable damages stemming from climate change.

Climate change is responsible not just for a rise in average global temperatures, but an increase in weather extremes and variations; a major risk and expense for municipalities. These changes magnify the existing infrastructure deficit by reducing expected lifespans of existing infrastructure and increasing the frequency of replacement. In addition, severe weather disrupts the local economy; damages the environment; and puts the population's health and well-being at risk. Investing in climate

adaptation is the most direct way to avoid or reduce future costs while mitigating risks to persons and property.

This past year, Canada has been acutely faced with climate change impacts. The 2023 Canadian wildfire season was the largest and most devastating on record, with nearly fourteen million hectares burned, hundreds of homes lost, and tens of thousands of people evacuated, including most of the Northwest Territories. This followed national temperature records for the May-June period being broken by 0.8^o C and persisting moderate to exceptional drought conditions across western Canada. Though weather is only one of the factors driving wildfire season severity, in Eastern Canada, climate change has been attributed to making wildfire seasons of 2023's severity at least seven times as likely to occur, compared to historic climate conditions.

Locally, the City of Thunder Bay continues to experience climate impacts. Spring flooding in 2022 caused more than \$3 million in infrastructure damage in the City, a degree of flooding that would be considered a one in a hundred-year event based on "historic" climate conditions. This event follows other major flooding events in 2008, 2012, and 2016. Warmer winters has led to the designation of Thunder Bay and area as a Lyme Disease risk area, as the species of ticks that carry the disease can now routinely survive our winters. Between 2021 and 2023, Thunder Bay experienced 34 days above 30°C, while the local historical average is only 2.7 days above 30°C a year, presenting a serious health risk particularly towards children, older adults, people living with chronic illness, and outdoor workers. Even if global action on reducing greenhouse gas emissions achieves its goals, these impacts are projected to continue to intensify for decades to come.

Effective climate adaptation requires considering social consequences. Climate change impacts are not fairly shared and can make existing social problems worse. People who are Indigenous, elderly, newcomers to Canada, or with lower socioeconomic status are more likely to be exposed to climate hazards, while being less likely to be able to access resources to adapt, avoid, or bounce back. Work is needed and ongoing to adequately include these considerations into the Climate Adaptation Strategy, including the community climate risk and vulnerability assessment underway in partnership with the Thunder Bay District Health Unit. Without action, these disproportionate impacts limit the potential for progress within the City.

To address these challenges, The City's Climate Adaptation Strategy is a long-term initiative that involves participation and engagement across all City Departments as well as collaboration amongst community stakeholders. It is a living document requiring ongoing effort to incorporate lessons learned, update best practices, and respond to experienced climate impacts. The Climate Adaptation Strategy complements the mitigation actions found in Climate Forward City: Thunder Bay Net-Zero Strategy.

This Report provides an update on the Climate Adaptation Strategy relative to its seven Strategic Directions, identified below.

Strategic Direction Highlights

Integrate: Integrate climate adaptation into plans, policies, procedures, projects, and investment decisions.

- 1. Climate resilience and the climate emergency have been identified in the Corporate Strategic Plan, including objectives on public climate change education, investing in climate-resilient infrastructure, and incorporating climate change projections into planning.
- 2. Work continues on the Boulevard By-law supporting greater use of native species and increased climate resilient habitats.
- 3. Development has been initiated for a Climate Lens procedure for Corporate Reporting. This was identified as an action item in the Net-Zero Strategy and addresses a key action from the Climate Adaptation Strategy.

Assess Potential Threats: Understand the risks specific to climate change impacts.

- 1. Work on an updating local climate risk and vulnerability assessment is underway in partnership with the Thunder Bay District Health Unit to help prioritize future adaptation and emergency response actions.
- 2. As the City of Thunder Bay works through Phase two and three of the Asset Management Plan, risk assessments are being conducted including climate risks along with potential mitigation and adaptation options for all assets. This will help inform decision-making and strategic long-term investments to reduce the infrastructure risks associated with climate change and capitalize on opportunities.
- 3. Flood mitigation studies of the Intercity area were initiated to inform future infrastructure projects and outline large scale flood mitigation options. The Regional Public Works Commissioners of Ontario (RPWCO) Climate Resilience Roadmap for Ontario Municipal Infrastructure and Systems was piloted on the same region, and will serve as a case study for other communities.

Increase Resilience: Increase resilience of infrastructure and natural landscapes.

- 1. 850 trees were planted by the City in 2023, with a focus on increasing species diversity and increasing canopy cover in open spaces. This work complements efforts to preserve mature trees.
- 2. Ash tree removals due to impacts from the emerald ash borer continue.
- 3. The City is partnering with the Lakehead Region Conservation Authority (LRCA), Fort William First Nation, and the Remedial Action Plan for Lake Superior on the environmental remediation of Mountdale Boat Launch, providing improved habitat, water filtration, and opportunities for community learning.
- 4. The City partnered with the LRCA on an low impact development (LID) detention area incorporating native planting restoration next to Boulevard Lake Playground, and an engineered wetland in Fisherman's Park West.
- 5. Rebate programs, including the residential drainage rebate and rain garden rebate, continue to be offered by the City through EcoSuperior to help citizens manage stormwater on their property.

Inform and Equip: Provide information, tools and training on climate adaptation to facilitate and accelerate action.

- 1. Corporate orientation sessions for new city employees continues to include a climate change session to provide education and training from a climate change perspective.
- 2. The Thunder Bay Climate Change Connection website (climatechangetbay.com) provides citizens and organizations with a set of locally relevant resources related to Climate Change and Adaptation.
- 3. Municipal climate change staff continue to engage with the public via booths, presentations, and public events.

Finance: Plan for the financing and long-term implementation of adaptive actions.

- \$2 million was received through Northern Ontario Heritage Fund (NOHFC), and \$1.7 million was received through the Canada Cultural Spaces fund for the Centennial Botanical Conservatory Renewal, which will support creation of production greenhouses supplying the City's low impact developments and other green infrastructure; and improving public access to learning opportunities.
- Thunder Bay continues to receive funds through the National Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund (DMAF) including a \$13.1 million commitment for a Community Flood Mitigation Project that has allowed significant upgrades to Boulevard Dam and the stormwater system throughout Thunder Bay.
- Application has been made for NOHFC funding of the Outdoor Venue and Events Project at the Conservatory which includes a Zero-Runoff storm water management strategy, and a reduction in urban-heat island effects through a reduction in paved areas by 30% to be combined with an increase in tree canopy by 40%.
- 4. Canada's National Adaptation Strategy was released in November 2022 and included the dedication of funds for municipal adaptation initiatives through the DMAF and the Federation of Canadian Municipalities Green Municipal Fund. These Federal commitments represent future opportunities for funding adaptation actions the City could access.
- 5. Grant applications for adaptation initiatives are supported through explicit climate adaptation and resilience references in the Corporate Strategic Plan, and references to actions listed in the Climate Adaptation Strategy.
- 6. Grant programs typically require a matching investment from the municipality in addition to staff time. Internal capacity has been limiting factor for accessing new external funds this past year.

Network & Collaborate: Investigate opportunities to increase the resiliency of the region through networks and strategic collaboration.

- 1. The municipal emergency exercises for 2021, 2022, and 2023 focused on collaboration with local governments and organizations. An emergency exercise framework was developed from lessons learned to support other regions in developing their own collaborative exercises.
- 2. Parks and Open Space Planning is partnering with the LRCA and the Remedial Action Plan for Lake Superior to build a program for growing Native Natural

Seedlings and Plants for use in habitat restoration and low impact development projects across the city. The strategy behind this partnership is to utilize the new Greenhouse Growing Facility, which was part of the phase one conservatory renewal, to produce locally sourced and chain of supply of seed and plants native to our region.

- 3. The City is participating in numerous networks and programs including, the Lake Superior Living Labs Network, the Risk Return on Investment Tool Municipal Advisory Committee, Resilient Infrastructure for Sustainable Communities, the Regional Public Works Commissioners of Ontario Climate Change Subcommittee, the Great Lakes Climate Adaptation Network, and ICLEI Building Adaptive and Resilient Communities.
- 4. The City continues to collaborate and network with other communities throughout Ontario and Canada. Municipal staff have been invited to present on climate adaptation successes and lessons learned through conferences, webinars, and public gatherings.

Respond and Recover: Plan for efficient response and recovery to extreme weather events and disasters.

- 1. Municipal emergency exercises for 2021, 2022, and 2023 focused on climate impacts, preparing regional decision-makers to respond effectively to future events.
- 2. The City of Thunder Bay has been selected as a host municipality for the 2024 Provincial Priority Emergency Exercise, focused on extreme heat events.
- 3. The Municipal Emergency Operations Control Group is in the process of updating the current Emergency Response Plan for the Corporation.
- 4. The Infrastructure, Development and Operations Department's emergency plan is being reviewed and updated following corporate reorganization.
- 5. The Thunder Bay COVID-19 Severe Weather Response Plan is in place for communication and coordination to support needs of vulnerable populations during severe weather events.

Climate Change Indicators

Seventeen (17) key indicators continue to be collected to measure success and track how the City and community are preparing for, responding to, and recovering from priority climate change impacts. The 2022 indicators are the seventh set of data collected and are measured against the 2016 baseline year. The indicators were developed to illustrate trends, monitor impacts and track progress made on Adaptation Strategy goals.

The COVID-19 pandemic directly impacted some of the indicators, such as internal and external engagement due to cancellation of in person events, as well as the evacuees hosted indicator, as requests for the city to host groups were initially denied due to capacity concerns during the pandemic response.

Indicators will continue to be collected over the long-term and will provide the ability to analyze trends and help to inform future decisions.

LINK TO EARTHCARE SUSTAINABILITY

This Report supports Goal 4 of the EarthCare Sustainability Plan 2014-2020 to "Build community resilience to reduce the risks inherent in climate change, and take advantage of opportunities for sustainable initiatives associated with current and future impacts of climate change" and is an outcome of Corporate Action 4.B.b. to "Develop a Climate Adaptation Strategy to support existing adaptive actions that build resilience and address vulnerabilities".

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

Although there are no immediate financial implications regarding this report, climate impacts are a significant and growing financial risk to Canadian Municipalities. Severe weather events across Canada caused \$2.3 billion a year in average annual insured losses between 2011 and 2020, compared to average annual insured losses of \$0.4 billion per year from 1983 to 2000 (inflation adjusted). 2022 was the third-worst year for insured losses in Canadian History, with disasters in nearly every part of the country. Insured losses only represent a fraction of total losses, with uninsured losses estimated to be higher.

Canada's National Adaptation Strategy estimates that every dollar invested in adaptation saves eight dollars in future costs.

CONCLUSION

The City of Thunder Bay continues work to adapt to the impacts of climate change. The costs of not investing in adaptation are significant; and affect infrastructure, social functioning, and public safety.

Work has included changes to policies, adaptations in infrastructure design, considerations in city planning, and ongoing community education and collaboration.

The City of Thunder Bay Climate Adaptation Strategy: Climate-Ready City guides adaptation efforts within the City, complementing the climate mitigation actions in the Net-Zero Strategy.

BACKGROUND

A Climate Emergency was declared by City Council in January 2020.

The City of Thunder Bay Climate Adaptation Strategy was adopted by City Council in 2015, 184/2015 (Infrastructure and Operations).

A presentation on the progress of the development of the Climate Adaptation Strategy was presented to City Council on February 2, 2015.

A call to action to climate change adaptation from the Great Lakes and St. Lawrence Cities Initiative was answered by Mayor Keith Hobbs on April 16, 2014.

Climate adaptation was first recognized in the 2012 EarthCare Annual Report to Council.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED

Attachment A: 2022 Climate Adaptation Indicators

REPORT PREPARED BY

Jacob Porter, Climate Adaptation Coordinator

REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY:

Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure, Development & Operations

Date (10/27/2023)

Attachment A - 2022 Climate Ad	aptation Indicators									
Indicator	Trend	Data Source	Notes	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Overarching Indicators										
Concentration of global atmospheric carbon dioxide in particles per million (ppm)	Driving force behind climate change.	NOAA	Pre-industrial levels did not exceed 300 ppm in past 800 000 years. This increase is the primary driver of climate change.	402.9	405.1	407.5	409.8	412.5	414.7	417.1
# of instances and # of days on flood watch and flood warning	Instances of flooding threat to the community	LRCA	Spring 2022 snow surveys were the highest ever recorded by the LRCA. Water content equivalent of 220-325 mm, compared to an a typical range of of 20-84 mm. The Neebing-McIntyre floodway diverted flows for 16 consecutive days; the first time in 5 years flows were diverted.	0	0	1 warning, 1 watch	3 warnings 4 watches	0 warnings 3 watches	0	1 warning 2 watches
# of weeks in declared low water condition	Instances of drought warning	LRCA		5	0	0	0	16	18	0
Goal 1: Integrate climate change adapta	tion into operational procedures as	well as land-use, f	inancial, and strategic planning.	L			•		L	
% of annual expenditures that are directly	Degree to which resources are being allocated to climate change adaptation; reflects the level of priority which the City is placing on adaptation	City of Thunder Bay	2020 included a \$ 5M investment in the Boulevard Lake Dam	\$591 K 0.336%	\$1.39 M 0.72%	\$3.81 M 2.08%	\$5.39 M 2.71%	\$9.73 M 3.62%	\$6.61 M 2.35%	\$4.98 M 1.56%
% of Corporate Reports that include climate adaptation measures	Degree to which the City is embedding adaptation in its activities	City of Thunder Bay	10 out of 115 reports included adaptation concerns or measures. The year 2020 was an outlier as it featured a smaller amount of total corporate reports to council and a large amount of stormwater contracts.	4.0%	6.0%	9.2%	11.3%	16.4%	9.1%	8.7%
# of Climate Adaptation training sessions for City Staff	Training sessions improving awareness and understanding of climate adaptation among city staff	City of Thunder Bay Climate Adaptation	Includes climate adaptation led informational sessions in corporate orientation, emergency mangagement, and special presentations on topic; but not active work on adaptation projects. No live corporate orientation sessions were held due to COVID-19, and self paced virtual sessions were not included.	n/a	n/a	n/a	13	7*	8*	3*
Goal 2: Respond and recover effectively	v from sustained and/or multiple extr	eme events in the	region.							
# of evacuees hosted from other communities	Response of City to support regional emergencies	City of Thunder Bay	Hosted evacuees from two different communities due to flooding risk, one for 26 days and one for 19 days.	327	150	279	1738	635	812	501
# of times and # of days fire response is triggered in response to weather-related events		City of Thunder Bay Fire Database	Calls were associated with heavy snow and high winds.	1 day 64 responses	3 days 67 responses	>6 days 231 responses	3 days 76 responses	5 days 62 responses	1 day 33 responses	>12 days 63 response

Attachment A - 2022 Climate Ad	laptation Indicators									
Indicator	Trend	Data Source	Notes	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Goal 3: Support the community in prepa	aring for, responding to, and recover	ing from extreme	weather events.							
# of people engaged in activities through EarthCare related to climate change adaptation	Effort and success of the City's outreach activities	City of Thunder Bay Climate Adaptation	Many outreach activities were not live due to COVID-19,, such as the creation of local climate change fact sheets, educational fact sheets, or online open houses. As such, those numbers are not included in totals.	586	1340	1723	2626	237*	801*	460*
% of population below Low Income Measure (After Tax)	Social determinants of vulnerability	StatCan	Low income is linked to a higher vulnerability to extreme weather events. There have been studies indicating Thunder Bay's vulnerable populations are underreported by the census, so this number is likely underestimating rates.	13.8%	13.8%	13.8%	13.8%	13.8%	11.6%	11.6%
% of of population reporting a strong or very strong sense of community belonging	Social resilience from extreme weather events	City of Thunder Bay Citizen Satisfaction Survey	Strong community social networks are a key determinant of resilience to disruption. Reported in Citizen Satisfaction Survey first time in 2019, and updated every two years.	n/a	n/a	n/a	88%	88%	82%	82%
Goal 4: Consider climate change impac	ts in the design, construction, and m	aintenance of phy	sical infrastructure while considering affordabilit	y and co-be	enefits.					
# of weather-related by-pass events at the Water Pollution and Control Plant	Impact of extreme weather on critical water infrastructure	City of Thunder Bay Environment	Nine by-pass events due to wet weather, in addition to eleven by-pass events due to power outages which may or may not be weather related, and are not included in the indicator. All by-passes in 2021 received some level of treatment.	8	3	4	4	1	9	20
# of frozen water services	Capacity of the system to respond to extreme temperatures	City of Thunder Bay Environment	85 services spent at least some time on by-pass as a preventative measure.	17	14	153	44	2	14	92
# of hours of power failures per customer are triggered in response to adverse weather	Impact of extreme weather on critical energy infrastructure	Synergy North Synergy North Database	Adverse weather is defined as an interruption resulting from rain, ice storms, snow, winds, extreme temperatures, freezing rain, frost, or other extreme weather conditions.	0.02	1.56	0.24	0.42	0.23	0.31	0.47
% of impervious area within City limits	Risks associated with peak flows and urban flooding	City of Thunder Bay	Tracked every 3-5 years with new aerial surveys. Reduced impervious area is considered to reduce flooding, reduce heat island effect, and increase greenspace.	17.8%	14.7%	14.7%	14.7%	14.7%	14.7%	14.7%
Goal 5: Foster resiliency of the City's na	atural landscape to ongoing changes	in climate.	······			÷			•	
% of municipality with tree canopy coverage	Resilience of the City to climate change and the ability of the City to increase the forest cover	City of Thunder Bay Parks	Percentage is within urban City limits. New aerial surveys are required for updated data, with the last update in 2017. Analysis on the most recent aerial survey is underway.	25.0%	27.7%	27.7%	27.7%	27.7%	27.7%	27.7%
Hectares of catchment areas of Low Impact Development sites	How much stormwater is treated through LIDs before being released into the waterways	City of Thunder Bay Low Impact Development	Two Low Impact Development sites constructed in 2021	7.5	16.9	20.1	22.8	23.2	27.6	28.4



Memorandum

то:	Krista Power, City Clerk	FILE:
FROM:	Jacob Porter, Climate Adaptation Coord	linator
DATE:	10/23/2022	
SUBJECT:	Climate Adaptation Update 2023 R 321/ Request to Present Information	/2023
MEETING & DATE:	Committee of the Whole – 11/06/2023	

I respectfully request an opportunity to provide a presentation relevant to Corporate Report 321 - 2023 Climate Adaptation Update to the Committee of the Whole at their meeting on Monday, November 6, 2023. I will present a PowerPoint Presentation highlighting Climate Adaptation progress relative to the Climate Adaptation Strategy for 2023.

Sincerely,

Jacob Porter Climate Adaptation Coordinator Infrastructure, Development & Operations



Corporate Report

REPORT NUMBER	R 333-2023-Infrastructure, Development & Operations-					
DATE PREPARED	October 24, 2023 FILE					
MEETING DATE	November 6, 2023					
SUBJECT	Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRRAP)					

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report 333-2023, Infrastructure, Development and Operations– Capital Facility Construction, we recommend that a Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRAPP) be developed to meet the City's requirements under Ontario Regulation 25/23: Broader Public Sector: Energy Reporting and Conservation and Demand Management Plans;

AND THAT Appropriation #16 be approved;

AND THAT any relevant agreements be executed by the General Manager Infrastructure, Development & Operations;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

The GRRAP aligns with City Council's Strategic Goal to take decisive action to respond to the climate emergency by accelerating initiatives to reduce green house gas emissions.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to seek Council's approval to allocate funds from the Energy Management Reserve fund to support the development of the Corporation's Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRAPP) for city facilities. This plan will form the basis for the development of the City of Thunder Bay's Energy and Conservation Management Plan (ECDM) which is prescribed under the

Corporate Report 333-2023-Infrastructure, Development & Operations-Capital Facility Construction

Ministry of Energy's Ontario Regulation 25/23: Broader Public Sector: Energy Reporting and Conservation and Demand Management Plans.

DISCUSSION

Under O. Reg. 25/23, every public agency is to submit energy consumption reports for prescribed facilities to the Ministry of Energy by July 1 each year. Every fifth year, each public agency must also submit an energy conservation and demand management (ECDM) plan containing prescribed information as outlined within the regulation. The Regulation was revised in 2023 to include additional information to be submitted that requires a more technical analysis of the proposed energy efficiencies as well as cost and saving estimates of the current and proposed measures.

The Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan (GRRAP) is an essential step in informing the City's ECDM plan and creating a path to achieve GHG emission reduction targets by developing a strategic and comprehensive plan for city facilities. The scope of this strategic GRRAP aligns with an ASHRAE Level II Energy audit including detailed analysis and energy modeling of existing infrastructure and processes, establishing the City's Scope 1, 2 and 3 emissions inventory based on available data and compared to business as usual GHG emissions until 2050, setting GHG reduction targets and creating a final report that outlines steps, measures, infrastructure requirements, and high level financial scenarios to meet and/or exceed the City's GHG emissions reduction targets. The GRRAP will include 1.4 million square feet of City facilities including administrative facilities, public works yards, community recreation facilities, commercial facilities, long term care facilities, and emergency services facilities. The GRRAP will serve to support the Asset Management Program providing supporting information for asset renewal.

The City is a member of the Ontario Education Consortium Marketplace (OECM) which is a collaborative sourcing partner which obtains preferred pricing for Ontario's education sector, broader public sector, and not-for-profit organizations. OECM put out a public Request for Proposal (RFP) for consulting services including the development of strategies to reduce use of natural gas. Blackstone Energy Services Ltd. (Blackstone) was the successful consultant. The City is able to access the RFP pricing as a member of the consortium. Currently Blackstone is currently completing the GRRAP for six city arenas and the City is satisfied with their work.

Blackstone has the capacity to complete the required analysis for the City's remaining facilities. To meet the July 1, 2024 deadline for submission to the Ministry of Energy, a 2023 Q4 start date for the GRRAP is recommended.

Corporate Report 333-2023-Infrastructure, Development & Operations-Capital Facility Construction

LINK TO EARTHCARE SUSTAINABILITY PLAN

The Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan will align with the Climate Forward City: Net Zero Strategy's objective 4.6: Existing residential, commercial, municipal, and industrial buildings are retrofit to achieve deep energy savings and reduction emissions.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The Corporate Energy Innovation Reserve Fund has been established to fund future energy initiatives and the estimated uncommitted balance is \$458,787. Appropriate #16 (Attachment 1) is presented to approve the transfer of \$200,000 from the Corporate Energy Innovation Reserve Fund into the Capital Facilities Construction 2023 Capital Budget in order to complete the GRRAP for facilities.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Appropriation #16 be approved in order to fund the development of the Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Roadmap and Action Plan to meet the Ministry of Energy July 1, 2024 submission deadline for the Energy Conservation and Demand Management Plan.

BACKGROUND

Not Applicable.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED

Attachment 1: Appropriation 16

REPORT PREPARED BY

Vanessa DeGiacomo-Zwaresh, Energy Analyst - Infrastructure, Development and Operations Department

REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY

Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure, Development & Operations

Date (10/27/2023)

				DATE: C	Oct 24, 2022		
DEPARTMENT: Infrastructure, Development and Operations		REQUEST FOR APPROPRIATION CHANGE					
DIVISION: Capital Facility Construction	REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL APPROPRIATION				X	16 APPROI	2 NO
						7.111(0)	110.
WBS ELEMENT	DESCRIPTION		BUDGET AVAILABLE	INCREASE	DECREASE	ADMIN IM Position	
COM-FFE-230118-2-R (NEW)	Greenhose Gas Emissions Reduction			200,000	200.000	2.1.1	120
	Corporate Energy Innovation Reserve	e Fund			200,000		120
				200,000	200,000		
EXPLANATIONS/REASONS:			EFFECT ON LE	EVEL OF SER\	/ICE:		
Please refer to Corporate Report 333-2023			DECREASE	INCREASE	MAINTAINED		
1			DECREASE		X]	
					DATE:		
				F	RECOMMENDED	APPROVED	
					Kerí Greaves		
					Keri Greaves		
					CITY TREASUR	RER	
					Norm Gale		
					Norm Gale	-	
					CITY MANAGE		
PREPARED BY: Grant Eklund		VERIFIED BY					
		Moíra Gallagher, CPA, CMA			APPROVED	NOT APPROV	ΈD
REVIEWED BY: Kerri Marshall Kerri Marshall		Budget & Planning Accountant			DATE:		
	structure Development and Operations	Corporate Services & Long Term Ca	are Department				-



Memorandum

Office of the City Clerk Fax: 623-5468 Telephone: 625-2230

TO: Mayor & Council

FROM: Krista Power, City Clerk

DATE: Tuesday, October 24, 2023

SUBJECT: Outstanding List for Operations Session as of October 24, 2023 Committee of the Whole – November 6, 2023

The following items are on the outstanding list for Operations:

Reference Number (yyyy-nnn- MTG)	Department/Div	Outstanding Item Subject	Resolution Report Back Date - (on or before date)	Revised Report Back Date - (on or before date) (Memos presented at COW updating or delaying Item)
2014-002- INO	Infrastructure & Operations / Engineering & Operations	Residential Wattage Reduction Report	No date included in original resolution	May-05-2025
2020-047- INO	Infrastructure & Operations / Engineering & Operations	Electric Scooter Pilot Participation	Dec-01-2026	Feb-01-2027
2021-107- INO	Infrastructure & Operations / Engineering - Parks & Open Spaces	Tree Production at Conservatory	Dec-20-2021	04-Dec-2023

2021-108- INO	Infrastructure & Operations/Engine ering & Operations	Tactile Walking Indicators	Jan-15-2024	Mar-4-2024
2023-101- INO	Infrastructure & Operations	Strong Towns Principle 1 - Financial Solvency	Dec-04-2023	
2023-104- INO	Infrastructure & Operations/Engine ering & Operations	Leland Avenue Median Naturalization	Dec-07-2026	
2023-105- INO	Infrastructure & Operations/Engine ering & Operations	Outdoor Rinks – Request for Closures - cost savings	Dec-04-2023	
2023-106- INO	Infrastructure & Operations/Engine ering & Operations	Outdoor Rinks – Request for Closures - usage statistics	Jun-03-2024	
2023-107- INO	Infrastructure & Operations/Engine ering & Operations	Outdoor Rinks – Request for Closures - potential changes	Sep-16-2024	



2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee Meeting Minutes

Thursday, September 14, 2023, 11:38 a.m. Northwestern Ontario Innovation Centre 2400 Nipigon Rd.

1. 2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee Meeting 08-2023

Co-Chairs: Cynthia Olsen and Barry Streib

2. Executive Members

Councillor Greg Johnsen, City Council Barry Streib, Community Volunteer – Co-Chair John Cameron - Community Economic Development Commission (CEDC) Matthew Lawrence, Games Coordinator Madison Pasma, Games Ontario - Government of Ontario

3. Sub-Committee Chairs and Co-Chairs

Leigh Abthorpe, Community Volunteer – Accommodations Co-Chair Matthew Villella, Community Volunteer – Administration Chair Matthew Pearson, Manager - Central Support – Finance Chair Bonnie Tittaferrante, Community Volunteer – Food Services Chair Jeff Hansen, Community Volunteer – Logistics Co-Chair Stacey Levanen, Supervisor - Corporate Communications and Community Engagement – Marketing and Communications Co-Chair Stephanie Reid, Communications Officer - Marketing and Communications Co-Chair Jim Glena, Community Volunteer – Security Co-Chair Greg Stephenson, Community Volunteer – Security Co-Chair Karen Bonazzo, Special Events Developer – Special Events Chair Ally Drombolis, Customer Service and Marketing Coordinator – Sponsorship Chair Laurel Knowles, Community Volunteer – Sport Technical Chair Tessa Hettrick, Volunteer Program Coordinator – Volunteer Services Co-Chair Samantha Stovel, Volunteer Program Coordinator – Volunteer Services Co-Chair Jack Avella, Director - Corporate Information Technology – IT Chair Scott Garner, Municipal Accessibility Specialist – Accessibility Chair

4. Organization Representatives

Alyssa Cacciatore, Fort William Historical Park Representative – ex-officio Erin Moir, EcoSuperior Representative – Sustainability Co-Chair

5. Officials

Lori Wiitala, Committee Clerk/Legislative Specialist

6. Guests

Dan Gelmich, Fort William First Nation (FWFN)

7. Welcome and Disclosures of Interest

Co-Chair Barry Streib, called the meeting to order, there were no disclosures of interest declared.

8. Agenda Approval

MOVED BY:Greg StephensonSECONDED BY:Jack Avella

WITH RESPECT to the September 14, 2023, meeting of the 2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

CARRIED

9. Minutes of Previous Meeting

The Minutes of Meeting 07-2023 of the 2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee, held on August 17, 2023, to be confirmed.

MOVED BY:	Matthew Lawrence
SECONDED BY:	Matthew Pearson

THAT the Minutes of Meeting 07-2023 2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee, held on August 17, 2023, be confirmed.

CARRIED

10. Vacancies

Co-Chair Barry Streib provided the following update relative to the above noted.

The representative from Shuniah has resigned and the committee is requesting an alternate to fill the position.

The Registration Committee Chair has resigned, and the committee is recruiting for the position.

11. Future Meeting Format

Barry Streib provided the following information relative to the above noted.

It is recommended for the Committee Chairs to meet and share information following the meetings; many components of the Ontario Winter Games will overlap and may require coordination between the committees.

A request was made to have committee reports provided prior to the meeting to be included with the agenda; it is recommended to include challenges in the report. Reports are requested to be emailed to Co-Chair Barry Streib and Committee Clerk/Legislative Specialist Lori Wiitala prior to the agenda being published.

With less than 5 months until the Ontario Winter Games commence the committee's goal is to be fully organized by January 31, 2024.

12. NOHFC Funding Announcement

Games Coordinator Matthew Lawrence provide the following update relative to the above noted.

Northern Ontario Heritage Fund - Corporation (NOHFC) application has been submitted and accepted as eligible and still awaiting approval; an update is expected to be provided at the October meeting. The maximum to be awarded is \$15,000.

13. Games Coordinator Update

Matthew Lawrence provided the following update relative to the above noted.

The Ontario Winter Games are currently at 18 sporting events with no further reduction; expecting approximately 2500 participants to attend. Provincial Sport Organization (PSO) meeting is scheduled for the end of October.

Request for Proposal (RFP) for merchandise are being sent out the week of September 18, 2023; looking to utilize vendors from previous events. Merchandise will be available for sale online and on-site, pre-sale merchandise will also be made available - date to be determined.

A meeting is scheduled with Generator on Monday, September 18, 2023, regarding signage. The Ministry has wayfinding signage available to utilize; Madison Pasma, Games Ontario, to provide a listing of available signage.

A request has been made to the schools for site visits.

A meeting was held to discuss equipment requirements such as heaters and tents. Discussion was also held regarding monitors for display and whether the City's Information Technology (IT) department would be able to provide or if the committee would have to source elsewhere.

An expanded organizational chart including all sub-committee positions for Games Officials is requested, Matthew Lawrence to prepare and distribute to committee.

Leading up to the Games the committee is increasing the meeting schedule to every two-weeks; dates will be determined and provided to the committee as soon as possible.

Discussion was held relative to highway bus travel for athletes and coaches to and from the Games and it is not recommended for bus travel in the winter months. Matthew Lawrence and Madison Pasma to reach out and advise accordingly.

14. Games Ontario Update

Madison Pasma, Games Ontario - Government of Ontario, provided the following update relative to the above noted.

A visit to Thunder Bay is scheduled for October 11 - 13, 2023, Isaac Blank, Games Ontario - Government of Ontario and Madison Pasma to attend. Madison advised the committee to reach out with any requests and provided a reminder of the importance of communication between the sub-committees.

Madison Pasma confirmed that Pachi is not available in October due to licensing; updates will be provided regularly.

A walk-through of event sites and a mock sporting event is being planned for October when Games Ontario - Government of Ontario, representatives visit.

15. Committee Reports

The following Committee Report updates will be provided:

15.1 Finance

Matthew Pearson provided the following update relative to the above noted.

It is requested for committees to regularly provide Matthew Pearson, Barry Streib and Matthew Lawrence updated numbers to keep the financials current. Overall, the loss of a few sports has improved the budget position.

15.2 Medical

Dr. Bruce Pynn to provide an update relative to the above noted.

Progress has been slow, a meeting with Dr. Wark (medical lead) and the Volunteer Committee is scheduled for the week of September 18, 2023.

Victoria Cleary, Medical Coordinator - Renfrew games, is providing a copy of the working manual report used at the Renfrew Games, the injuries and issues report is being reviewed as the combative sports were injury prone. Medical Committee estimates approximately 100 volunteers will be required.

15.3 Sponsorship

Ally Drombolis provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Requests for sponsorship have gone out; a meeting with the Partner Level (\$50,000) was successful. The current secured sponsorship is as follows:

- \$315,000 in secured sponsorship is expected, \$170,000 has been received and \$145,000 is outstanding;

- \$178,500 of in-kind sponsorship is secured, additional requests have gone out.

15.4 Marketing and Communications

Stacey Levanen and Stephanie Reid provided the following update relative to the above noted.

A media event with Tbaytel to announce volunteer recruitment is scheduled for September 14, 2023, at 1:30 p.m., directly following the committee meeting.

Media sponsorship is active with billboard and radio advertising; a request to provide any new or updated information to Stacey Levanen or Stephanie Reid to be included on media and social media platforms.

A meeting with the Airport Authority is being scheduled to discuss visual advertising. Looking at promoting the History of the Games and seeking photos and articles.

A newsletter is being produced and will be distributed weekly.

A meeting is being scheduled with Hydro One, Marketing and Communications Committee, Sponsorship Committee and Matthew Lawrence, to discuss media filler, athlete interviews and a potential meet & greet at the Thunder Bay International Airport.

15.5 Volunteer Services

Tessa Hettrick and Samantha Stovel provided the following update relative to the above noted.

The launch for volunteer recruitment will follow the meeting, Tbaytel is scheduled to attend.

Reminder that everyone interested in volunteering are required to submit an application, including City of Thunder Bay staff.

Volunteer orientation will be scheduled for the end of January 2024 location and dates are to be determined; kit pick-up is scheduled at West Thunder Community Centre, 915 Edward St. S., between February 2 - 4, 2024.

15.6 Special Events

Karen Bonazzo to provide the following update relative to the above noted.

Opening ceremonies to be held at Fort William Historical Park (FWHP) with a 6:30 p.m. start time.

Science North is confirmed and will be providing activities for athletes.

Discussions are being held relative to offering cultural events with an Indigenous focus at the Games, along with a potential Cultural sponsorship.

Discussion was held relative to an alternate plan for the opening ceremonies and there is no alternate option planned. Weather concerns were presented, and it was noted that this will not be the first event held during the winter months in Thunder Bay, and the event/opening ceremonies will move forward at the secured location.

15.7 Accommodations

Leigh Abthorpe provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Waiting on confirmation if Alpine event is moving from week 2 to week 1 of the Games; Matthew Lawrence expected to provide a response Friday, September 15, 2023.

A local hockey tournament is scheduled the same weekend as the Games and hotels are keeping to their agreement to hold the rooms for Games purposes. Discussion was held relative to safety and security at hotel locations; it is recommended to do a walkthrough of hotels, and look to book entire hotels when possible.

15.8 Sport Technical

Laurel Knowles provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Alpine Ontario indicates that both local downhill ski centres meet the technical requirements.

Potential for Alpine event to move to week 1 of the Games due to a scheduling conflict.

15.9 Food Services

Bonnie Tittaferrante provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Expression of Interest (EOI) have been returned and are being assessed.

Concern regarding moving Alpine event to week 1 from week 2; the move will nearly double the number of participants as follows:

- 1524 week 1
- 864 week 2.

15.10 Administration

Matthew Villella provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Working with Matthew Lawrence to procure medals and set up information booths at the Airport and venues.

Reviewing RFP's received to date.

Meeting with Volunteer Services is scheduled the week of September 18, 2023; also reaching out to Tourism Thunder Bay for information to provide to tourists.

15.11 Information Technology

Jack Avella provided the following update relative to the above noted.

The committee has been meeting regularly and have expressed concern

regarding potential date changes and require clarity on when it will be finalized. It was also noted that the PSO guidelines are vague, unclear, and lacking venue layouts which is a crucial component for this committee.

The committee is requesting an increase in their budget to \$10,000.

Laura Cumming is presently building the system and will be demonstrating to committee members within the next couple of weeks.

15.12 Logistics

Matthew Lawrence provided the following update relative to the above noted.

A meeting with Sport Technical committee will be scheduled in the next couple of weeks and Herb Daniher is invited to the meeting.

15.13 Registration

The Registration committee is currently vacant, and no update is available; recruitment for the position is open.

15.14 Transportation

Matthew Lawrence provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Todd Kennedy and Matthew Lawrence have met with travel agencies. Next steps are to secure bookings with airlines; meeting with the Airport Authority is scheduled for October.

The committee is in the process of developing travel schedules; 18 calendars are required to be updated and collaboration between committees is necessary to develop the schedule.

15.15 Accessibility

Scott Garner provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Accessible customer service will be part of training; looking to schedule a meeting with Volunteer Services to discuss requirements.

It is requested to see the Provincial wayfinding signage to determine

accessibility, and Madison Pasma agreed to provide examples at a future meeting Games Ontario - Government of Ontario, representatives attend.

During the site visits concern was presented relative to the accessibility at the PACI Building, and it was determined that this location will not be utilized for the Games.

15.16 Sustainability

Erin Moir provided the following update relative to the above noted.

The committee is working on signage; and a potential water sponsorship.

15.17 Security

Greg Stephenson and Jim Glena provided the following update relative to the above noted.

Fencing has requested 2 security at their event.

Intention to connect with Police Foundations Program - Confederation College, to request security volunteers; also reaching out to Thunder Bay Police Service (TBPS) to request off-duty officers to volunteer in addition to on-duty officers, when available.

16. New Business

17. Announcements

A media event to launch volunteer recruitment will be held at 1:30 p.m. at the Northwestern Ontario Innovation Centre; Kathleen Jones, Vice-President - Sales, Marketing and Communication - Tbaytel, will be in attendance.

18. Next Meeting

The 2024 Ontario Winter Games Organizing Committee Meetings will be held the 2nd Thursday of each month, at the Northwestern Ontario Innovation Centre, 2400 Nipigon Rd., at 11:30 a.m. unless noted otherwise, as follows:

- Thursday, October 12, 2023
- Thursday, November 9, 2023
- Thursday, November 23, 2023

- Thursday, December 7, 2023
- Thursday, December 14, 2023

19. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 1:23 p.m.



BOARD MINUTES

MINUTES OF BOARD (REGULAR SESSION) MEETING NO. 14/2023 OF THE DISTRICT OF THUNDER BAY SOCIAL SERVICES ADMINISTRATION BOARD

DATE OF MEETING:	September 21, 2023
------------------	--------------------

TIME OF MEETING: 10:00 a.m.

LOCATION OF MEETING:

CHAIR:

Ken Boshcoff

Thunder Bay, ON

Microsoft Teams &

3rd Floor Boardroom

TBDSSAB Headquarters 231 May Street South

PRESENT:

Albert Aiello Ken Boshcoff Meghan Chomut Kasey Etreni Nancy Gladun Brian Hamilton Greg Johnsen Kathleen Lynch Elaine Mannisto Jim Moffat Dominic Pasqualino Jim Vezina

REGRETS:

Anne-Marie Bourgeault Mark Thibert **OFFICIALS:**

Bill Bradica, Chief Administrative Officer Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division Glenda Flank, Recording Secretary

GUESTS:

Roxanne Brunelle Crupi, Manager, Human Resources Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs Marty Farough, Manager, Infrastructure & Asset Management Louise Piercey, Manager, Child Care & Early Years Programs Jennifer Lible, Manager, Social Assistance Programs Michelle Wojciechowski, Manager, Intake & Eligibility Aaron Park, Supervisor, Research & Social Policy Carole Lem, Communications & Engagement Larissa Jones, Communications Assistant

Note: For the purposes of the Minutes references to TBDSSAB or the Board refers to The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board of Directors as relevant to specific agenda items; references to TBDHC or the Board refers to the Directors of Thunder Bay District Housing Corporation as relevant to specific agenda items. References to CAO refer jointly to the Chief Administrative Officer of TBDSSAB and Senior Administrator of TBDHC.

BOARD MEETING

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

Albert Aiello, Board Member declared a non-pecuniary conflict of interest relative to the Vale Community Centre Site, Lease Expiry.

NEW BUSINESS

CONFIRMATION OF BOARD MEETING AGENDA

Resolution No. 23/69

Moved by: Kasey Etreni Seconded by: Albert Aiello

THAT with respect to the agenda for the Board Regular and Closed Session meetings of The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board for September 21, 2023, we approve the agendas as presented;

AND THAT we approve any additional information and new business.

CARRIED

MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

Board Meetings

Minutes of Meeting No. 12/2023 (Regular Session) and Meeting No. 13/2023 (Closed Session) of TBDSSAB, held on June 15, 2023, respectively, were presented to the Board.

Resolution No. 23/70

Moved by: Nancy Gladun Seconded by: Kasey Etreni

THAT the Minutes of Meeting No. 12/2023 (Regular Session) and Meeting No. 13/2023 (Closed Session) of The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, held on June 15, 2023, respectively, be confirmed.

CARRIED

Committee Meetings

Minutes of the Child Care and Early Years Advisory Table held on April 25, 2023 were presented to the Board.

CLOSED SESSION MEETING

Administration presented a recommendation to the Board to adjourn to a closed meeting relative to receipt of information with respect to personal matters regarding identifiable individuals, including members of the Administration regarding the CAO Performance Evaluation and 2024 TBDSSAB Market Rent Report, relative to receipt of information of which a council, board, committee or other body may hold a closed meeting under another statute regarding a potential funding opportunity through the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, relative to receipt of information with respect to the security of the property of the Corporation regarding the Development of Transitional and Supportive Housing – Homelessness Prevention Program and a proposed or pending acquisition or disposition of land by the Corporation with respect to the Vale Community Centre Site, Lease Expiry.

Resolution No. 23/71

Moved by:	Elaine Mannisto
Seconded by:	Greg Johnsen

THAT the Board adjourn to a closed meeting relative to receipt of information with respect to personal matters regarding identifiable individuals, including members of the Administration regarding the CAO Performance Evaluation and 2024 TBDSSAB Market Rent Report, relative to receipt of information of which a council, board, committee or other body may hold a closed meeting under another statute regarding a potential funding opportunity through the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, relative to receipt of information with respect to the security of the property of the Corporation regarding the Development of Transitional and Supportive Housing – Homelessness Prevention Program and a proposed or pending acquisition or disposition of land by the Corporation with respect to the Vale Community Centre Site, Lease Expiry.

CARRIED

REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATION

Chief Administrative Officer Performance Evaluation

Ken Boshcoff, Board Chair provided a verbal update regarding the CAO Performance Evaluation in Closed Session.

On consensus the following recommendation was presented.

Resolution No. 23/72

Moved by: Elaine Mannisto Seconded by: Albert Aiello

THAT with respect to the verbal update provided by Ken Boshcoff, Chair the Board directs Roxanne Brunelle, Manager, Human Resources to proceed as directed in Closed Session.

CARRIED

2024 TBDSSAB Market Rent Report

Report No. 2023-30, (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide information and Administration's recommendation regarding the 2024 market rents for the TBDSSAB owned units.

Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs provided an overview of the market rent process and responded to questions.

Resolution No. 23/73

Moved by: Kasey Etreni Seconded by: Jim Moffat

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023-30 (Integrated Social Services) we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, approve the 2024 market rents as outlined in Confidential Attachment #1 of Report No. 2023-30, presented in Closed Session.

AND THAT any approved market rent increase be effective February 1, 2024.

CARRIED

At 11:33 a.m. Ken Boshcoff, Board Chair left the meeting and Meghan Chomut, Vice Chair assumed the position of Chair of the meeting.

Development of Transitional and Supportive Housing – Homelessness Prevention Program

Report No. 2023CS-07, (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented in Closed Session to provide information regarding interest in the development of transitional and supportive housing and providing Administrations recommendations.

On consensus the following resolution was presented.

Resolution No. 23/74

Moved by: Elaine Mannisto Seconded by: Kasey Etreni

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023CS-07 (Integrated Social Services Division), we The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, direct that Administration proceed as directed in Closed Session.

CARRIED

Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation Funding Request

Report No. 2023CS-08, (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented in Closed Session to provide information regarding a potential funding opportunity through the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and providing Administration's recommendation.

On consensus the following resolution was presented.

Resolution No. 23/75

Moved by: Nancy Gladun Seconded by: Brian Hamilton

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023CS-08 (Corporate Services Division), we The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, direct that Administration proceed as directed in Closed Session;

And that we authorize the Chief Administrative Officer to complete any administrative items related to the approval process.

CARRIED

Vale Community Centre Site, Lease Expiry

Report No. 2023CS-09, (Integrated Social Services and Corporate Services Divisions) was presented in Closed Session to provide information regarding the expiry of the Vale Community Centre lease expiry and providing Administration's recommendation.

On consensus the following resolution was presented.

- N

Resolution No. 23/76

Moved by: Nancy Gladun Seconded by: Dominic Pasqualino

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023CS-09 (Integrated Social Services and Corporate Services Divisions) we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, direct the Chief Administrative Officer to proceed as directed in Closed Session.

CARRIED

At 11:37 a.m. Ken Boshcoff, Board Chair entered the meeting and resumed the position of Chair.

Canada-Ontario Community Housing Initiative, Ontario Priorities Housing Initiative and Canada-Ontario Housing Benefit Amendment 2023-24

Report No. 2023-31 (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide information regarding the continuation of the COCHI and OPHI and providing the Investment Plan for approval.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided clarification and responded to questions.

Resolution No. 23/77

Moved by: Brian Hamilton Seconded by: Elaine Mannisto

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023-31 (Integrated Social Services Division) we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, authorize the Chair and the Chief Administrative Officer, to execute the Transfer Payment Agreement for the Canada-Ontario Community Housing Initiative and the Ontario Priorities Housing Initiative and the Sign-Back Letter for the Canada-Ontario Housing Benefit and submit both to the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing;

AND THAT the Board approve the 2023-24 Investment Plan for the Canada-Ontario Community Housing Initiative and the Ontario Priorities Housing Initiative programs and authorize the Chief Administrative Officer to execute the plan and submit to the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing;

AND THAT the Board authorizes the Chief Administrative Officer to execute any required agreements for the delivery of the Canada-Ontario Community Housing Initiative and the Ontario Priorities Housing Initiative programs;

AND THAT any necessary By-law be presented to the Board, for consideration.

CARRIED

At 11:41 a.m. Louise Piercey, Manager, Child Care & Early Years Programs and Michelle Wojciechowski, Manager, Intake & Eligibility joined the meeting and Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs and Marty Farough, Manager, Infrastructure & Asset Management left the meeting.

Child Care Maximum Daily Rates and Fee Subsidy Schedule

Report No. 2023-32 (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide information and rationale for determining the maximum child care rates for fee subsidy recipients for the 2024 budget year.

Resolution No. 23/78

Moved by: Meghan Chomut Seconded by: Elaine Mannisto

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023-32 (Integrated Social Services Division) we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, approve the maximum child care rates for fee subsidy recipients, effective January 1, 2024, as presented.

CARRIED

Child Care and Early Years' Service Plan 2023-2028

Report No. 2023-33 (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide the proposed 2023-2028 Child Care and Early Years' Service Plan.

Louise Piercey, Manager, Child Care & Early Years Programs provided a brief overview of the Child Care and Early Years' Service Plan development.

Resolution No. 23/79

Moved by: Greg Johnsen Seconded by: Kasey Etreni

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023-33 (Integrated Social Services Division) we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, approve the draft 2023-2028 Child Care and Early Years' Service Plan as presented;

AND THAT the Chief Administrative Officer be authorized to submit the approved 2023-2028 Child Care and Early Years' Service Plan to the Ministry of Education.

CARRIED

At 11:46 a.m. Brian Hamilton, Board Member, Jennifer Lible, Manager, Social Services Programs and Aaron Park, Supervisor, Research & Social Policy joined the meeting.

TBDSSAB Second Quarter Operational Report

Report No. 2023-34 (Integrated Social Services Division) relative to providing the Board with the 2023 Second Quarter Operational Report, for information only.

At 11:47 a.m. Louise Piercey, Manager, Child Care & Early Years Programs, Michelle Wojciechowski, Manager, Intake & Eligibility, Jennifer Lible, Manager, Social Services Programs and Aaron Park, Supervisor, Research & Social Policy left the meeting.

TBDSSAB Second Quarter Strategic Plan Update

Report No. 2023-35 (Chief Administrative Officer Division) relative to providing the Board with the progress made on the Strategic Plan 2023, for consideration.

Resolution No. 23/80

Moved by: Nancy Gladun Seconded by: Albert Aiello

THAT with respect to Report No. 2023-35 (Chief Administrative Officer Division), we, The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, receive the 2023 Strategic Plan – 2023 Second Quarter Update for information only.

CARRIED

At 11:48 a.m. Greg Johnsen, Board Member left the meeting.

Ad-Hoc Situation Analysis Committee Recommendation to the Board

Memorandum from Kasey Etreni, Committee Chair dated September 6, 2023 was presented to the Board providing information relative to the Situation Analysis Committee Meeting and providing the Committee's recommendations.

Kasey Etreni, Committee Chair provided a brief background regarding the recommendations being presented to the Board

At 11:51 a.m. Brian Hamilton, Board Member joined the meeting.

Resolution No. 23/81

Moved by: Kasey Etreni Seconded by: Jim Moffat

THAT with respect to the Memorandum from Kasey Etreni, Chair – Situation Analysis Review Committee, we The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, approve recommendations 3 through 11 and 14 through 20 contained in the Situation Analysis Implementation Plan;

AND THAT the Chief Administrative Officer is to proceed with the implementation of those recommendations.

CARRIED

A discussion was held regarding the order that Administration should proceed relative to the addition of an Indigenous Representative on the Board of Directors. Bill Bradica, CAO requested clarification.

On consensus the Board directed the Chief Administrative Officer to proceed with determining the method of selection of an Indigenous Board Member prior to requesting that the legislation be amended relative to Resolution 23/81A.

Resolution No. 23/81A

Moved by: Albert Aiello Seconded by: Jim Moffat

THAT the Board call upon the Minister of Children, Community and Social Services to amend Schedule 6 of O.Reg. 278/98 under the *District Social Services Administration Board Act, R.S.O. 1990* to add an Indigenous representative to the Board;

AND THAT Administration be directed to proceed with determination of the selection process for the Indigenous Representative through consultation.

CARRIED

Resolution No. 23/81B

Moved by: Kasey Etreni Seconded by: Albert Aiello

THAT the Board approve the establishment of an Indigenous Advisory Committee;

AND THAT Administration be directed to report back to the Board with recommendations on the composition and Terms of Reference, in consultation with others.

CARRIED

Enterprise Risk Management Annual Update

Report No. 2023-36, (Corporate Services Division) was presented to the Board providing the annual update on the organization's Enterprise Risk Management (ERM) Framework.

Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division provided a brief overview of the development of the ERM report and responded to questions.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided clarification and responded to questions.

Following a discussion, on consensus, Administration to develop a shortened ERM report and circulate a draft template to the Board with a recommended format for review.

2023 Second Quarter Financial Report

Report No. 2023-37, (Corporate Services Division) was presented to the Board providing the 2023 Second Quarter Financial Report.

CORRESPONDENCE

City of Thunder Bay 2024 Budget

Memorandum from Norm Gale, City Manager with The City of Thunder Bay dated August 1, 2023 was presented to the Board providing information relative to the 2024 Operating Budget Direction Submission Request.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided a brief introduction to the memorandum and responded to questions.

Following a discussion, on consensus, Bill Bradica to develop and send a response to the memorandum.

2023-24 Additional Planning Allocations under the Canada-Ontario Housing Benefit Program

Correspondence from Hon. Paul Calandra, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing dated September 18, 2023 was presented to the Board providing information regarding additional planning allocation under the Canada-Ontario Housing Benefit Program.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided a brief overview regarding the funding and the allocation received and responded to questions.

Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division responded to questions.

BY-LAWS

Minutes of TBDSSAB Board (Regular Session) Meeting No. 14/2023 Page 12 of 12 September 21, 2023

NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board will be held on Thursday, October 19, 2023 at 10:00 a.m., in the 3rd Floor Boardroom, TBDSSAB Headquarters, 231 May Street South, Thunder Bay, Ontario and via Microsoft Teams.

ADJOURNMENT

Resolution No. 23/82

Moved by:	Kasey Etreni
Seconded by:	Nancy Gladun

THAT the Board Meeting No. 14/2023 of The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, held on September 21, 2023, be adjourned at 12:26 p.m.

CARRIED

Boshoo Chair

Chief Administrative Officer



THE DISTRICT OF THUNDER BAY SOCIAL SERVICES ADMINISTRATION BOARD



MINUTES OF BOARD (CLOSED SESSION) MEETING NO. 15/2023

OF

THE DISTRICT OF THUNDER BAY SOCIAL SERVICES ADMINISTRATION BOARD

DATE OF MEETING: September 21, 2023

TIME OF MEETING: 10:06 a.m.

LOCATION OF MEETING: Microsoft Teams & 3rd Floor Boardroom TBDSSAB Headquarters 231 May Street South Thunder Bay, ON

CHAIR:

Ken Boshcoff

PRESENT: Albert Aiello

Ken Boshcoff

Kasey Etreni Nancy Gladun Brian Hamilton Greg Johnsen

Meghan Chomut

Kathleen Lynch

Elaine Mannisto

Dominic Pasqualino

OFFICIALS:

Bill Bradica, Chief Administrative Officer Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Serrice Division Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division Glenda Flank, Recording Secretary

GUESTS:

Roxanne Brunelle Crupi, Manager, Human Resources Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs Marty Farough, Manager, Infrastructure & Asset Management Larissa Jones, Communications Assistant

REGRETS:

Jim Moffat

Jim Vezina

Anne-Marie Bourgeault Mark Thibert

Note: For the purposes of the Minutes references to TBDSSAB or the Board refers to The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board of Directors as relevant to specific agenda item; references to TBDHC or the Board refers to the Directors of Thunder Bay District Housing Corporation as relevant to specific agenda item. References to CAO refer jointly to the Chief Administrative Officer of TBDSSAB and Senior Administrator of TBDHC.

BOARD MEETING

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

Albert Aiello, Board Member declared a non-pecuniary interest regarding the Vale Community Centre Board Report.

At 10:06 a.m. Bill Bradica, CAO, Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division, Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division, Glenda Flank, Executive Assistant and Larissa Jones, Communications Assistant left the meeting.

Chief Administrative Officer Performance Evaluation

Ken Boshcoff, Board Chair provided an update regarding the Chief Administrative Officer's Performance Evaluation and responded to questions.

Roxanne Brunelle, Manager, Human Resources provided further information and responded to questions.

A discussion was held and on consensus a recommendation to be presented in Regular Session.

At 10:44 a.m. Bill Bradica, CAO, Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division, Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division, Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs, Glenda Flank, Executive Assistant and Larissa Jones, Communications Assistant joined the meeting and Roxanne Brunelle, Manager, Human Resources left the meeting.

Homelessness Prevention Program Capital Project Update

Memorandum from Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division dated July 27, 2023 was presented to the Board to provide an update on the Homelessness Prevention Program (HPP) Capital Project.

Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division provided a brief overview of the HPP Capital Project and responded to questions.

2024 TBDSSAB Market Rent Report

Memorandum from Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs, (Integrated Social Services Division) dated August 14, 2023, was presented to the Board to provide the confidential attachment to Report No. 2023-30.

Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division responded to questions.

Development of Transitional and Supportive Housing – Homelessness Prevention Program

Report No. 2023CS-07, (Integrated Social Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide information regarding the interest in the development of transitional and supportive housing and providing Administrations recommendations.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided an introduction to the report and responded to questions.

Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division provided further information and responded to questions.

At 10:58 a.m. Marty Farough, Manager, Infrastructure & Asset Management joined the meeting.

Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation Funding Request

Report No. 2023CS-08, (Corporate Services Division) was presented to the Board to provide information regarding the Repair Stream funding opportunity through Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and providing Administrations recommendation.

Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division provided a brief overview of the report, advised the Board of the process involved with the CMHC funding and responded to questions.

Bill Bradica, CAO responded to questions.

At 11:05 a.m. Albert Aiello, Board Member left the meeting.

Vale Community Centre Site, Lease Expiry

Report No. 2023CS-09, (Integrated Social Services and Corporate Services Divisions) was presented to the Board to provide information regarding the expiry of the Vale Community Centre lease expiry and providing Administrations recommendation.

Georgina Daniels, Director, Corporate Services Division provided further information and responded to questions.

Ken Ranta, Director, Integrated Social Services Division provided clarification and responded to questions.

Crystal Simeoni, Manager, Housing Programs responded to questions.

Bill Bradica, CAO provided clarification and responded to questions.

Marty Farough, Manager, Infrastructure & Asset Management responded to questions.

At 11:28 a.m. Albert Aiello, Board Member joined the meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Resolution No. 23/CS07

Moved by:	Kasey Etreni
Seconded by:	Greg Johnsen

THAT the Board (Closed Session) Meeting No. 15/2023 of The District of Thunder Bay Social Services Administration Board, held on September 21, 2023, be adjourned at 11:28 a.m., to reconvene in Open Session to consider the remaining agenda items.

CARRIED

er Bosh of Chair

Chief Administrative Officer



Corporate Report

REPORT NUMBER 335-2023-Corporate Services-Office of the City Treasurer		
DATE PREPARED	October 19, 2023	FILE
MEETING DATE	November 6, 2023	
SUBJECT Soccer Northwest Ontario – Multi-Use Indoor Sports Facility Concept – Financing Strategy		

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report 335-2023 Corporate Services, we recommend that the financing strategy to support the multi-use indoor sports facility concept, as proposed by Soccer Northwest Ontario (with City of Thunder Bay Facility Design Standard), be approved as outlined in this report;

AND THAT City Council approve the use of the Negotiation Method pursuant to section 4.09 of Corporate By-law 113-2011 (Supply Management) to engage Stantec Architecture Ltd. to consult on necessary studies and preliminary design;

AND THAT Administration report back in the first quarter 2024 with the results of these studies, a recommended project delivery approach, and the results of public engagement prior to commencement of a competitive procurement process;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

The realization of a proposed multi-use indoor sports facility is aligned with the strategic direction to keep our community healthy, safe and strong through equitable access to recreation and sport. The investment in the proposed facility will also support Council's strategic priority of growing our City.

The financing strategy supports the strategic direction to plan and deliver cost-effective services, with a focus towards long-term financial sustainability, accountability, and appropriate resource allocation.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report provides a recommended financing strategy to support the advancement of the proposed multi-use indoor sports facility concept developed by Soccer Northwest Ontario (SNO) in consultation with other key end-users to address the community's need for indoor sports, modified to comply with the City of Thunder Bay (CTB) Facility Design Standards Policy.

DISCUSSION

At the September 11, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting (Report 254-2023 – Community Services), Council confirmed the preferred site for a proposed multi-use indoor sports facility, on city-owned lands west of the Thunder Bay Community Auditorium. Council also directed Administration to develop a proposed financing strategy to support a competitive procurement process to advance the realization of the SNO Concept modified to comply with CTB Facility Design Standards.

Financing Strategy

Existing Commitments

In 2020, City Council considered construction of a multi-use indoor sports facility located at Chapples Park and approved financial resources totalling \$33,634,500 to support the project (Report 74-2020 Community Services – Asset Management). Although that project did not proceed, Council's direction persists, and the committed funds, less any expenses incurred to advance the project, remain committed to that project. Therefore, the following committed financial resources can be applied to the SNO Concept project (figures rounded to nearest hundred):

Special Debenture (25 years)	\$ 15,000,000
Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund	\$ 7,650,100
Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund	\$ 3,303,700
Canada Community Building Fund	<u>\$ 7,031,200</u>
Total Committed	\$ 32,985,000

Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund (Uncommitted)

The committed funds in the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund continue to earn investment income and, in accordance with Council Direction, additional amounts were transferred into the reserve fund from Municipal Accommodation Tax (MAT) revenue (2021: \$907,266 and 2022: \$1,371,141). In December 2022, Council approved an appropriation of \$170,000 from the reserve fund to engage a consultant to review the SNO Concept.

As a result, a further **\$3,020,700** (excluding investment income earned in 2023) is uncommitted in the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund and is available to support the financing strategy.

Proposed Financing Sources (2024 Budget)

Administration has identified additional sources of financing for the multi-use indoor sports facility. To support the financing strategy, Administration would include these sources in the 2024 Budget for Council's consideration during budget deliberations.

- The City of Thunder Bay collects MAT revenue (4%) from transient accommodation within the City, provides 50% to the Community Economic Development Commission, and retains 50% to fund projects that promote tourism and benefit residents and visitors. The current estimate of 2024 MAT available to the City (50%) is \$1.45 million. Administration recommends Council direction to transfer \$1,169,300 MAT revenue to the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund in the 2024 Budget. The remaining 2024 MAT revenue budget will be allocated to projects through the budget process.
- In accordance with Council direction (Report No. 98-2021 Corporate Services & Long Term Care Financial Services) Administration has directed Synergy North Corporation to make a principal payment of \$10,000,000 on the Note Payable to the City of Thunder Bay. Once that payment is received, Council has directed it be transferred into the Capital General Reserve Fund. Administration recommends Council direction to redirect a portion of the proceeds by including a \$1,500,000 transfer from the Capital General Reserve Fund to the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund in the 2024 Budget.
- Although the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund will continue to earn investment income and additional financing sources could be identified prior to construction, in order to demonstrate a complete financing strategy, Administration recommends Council approve further financing through a Special Debenture (25 years) up to \$5,900,000, bringing total debenture funding for the project to \$20,900,000 or 47% of the total estimated construction cost.

If Council approves this direction as part of the 2024 budget deliberation process, following budget adoption these financing sources will be committed to the project.

Alternate Financing Sources

In addition to the recommendations above, an alternate financing source from the Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund was considered by Administration. Withdrawals from this Reserve Fund must meet certain criteria, including the City's share of the capital cost of the project not to exceed 50%.

As discussed above, Council has committed \$3,303,700 to the project from the Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund. As well \$6,500,000 of the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund was originally transferred from the Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund in 2019. This was permitted since a significant matching contribution from senior levels of government was anticipated. However, considering the parameters of the SNO proposal, it is unlikely to qualify for other government grants. Therefore, Administration does not recommend further financing from the Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund (estimated uncommitted balance of \$15.2 million).

Competitive Procurement Process

The key to a successful public procurement process is clearly defined specifications which minimize ambiguity. To support the procurement process, Administration requires further direction regarding the proposed project delivery model for the proposed facility, including the proposed operating model.

Administration is researching various project delivery options and will report back in the first quarter 2024.

Next Steps

At the September 11, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, City Council also directed Administration to conduct public consultation on the proposed SNO Concept and site and report back in the first quarter 2024.

Further analysis, including environmental and geotechnical assessment and further refining of the design requirements to meet CTB Facility Design Standards, must also be done. Administration recommends Council approval to use the Negotiation Method of procurement, pursuant to section 4.09 of Corporate By-law 113-2011 (Supply Management), to engage with Stantec Architecture Ltd. to consult on this work. Funds are available for this work within the existing commitments from the Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund. Administration will report back to Council, the results of these studies, the community consultation, and the financial implications of the operating model, in the first quarter 2024, prior to commencing the competitive procurement process.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The Class 'C' estimate of the capital cost of construction for multi-use indoor sports facility with the SNO Design Concept, modified to comply with CTB Facility Design Standards, is summarized below:

Base Building Cost	\$	27,706,800
Site and Ancillary Work	\$	3,190,500
Allowances	\$	12,906,700
Non-Rebateable HST	<u>\$</u>	771,000
Total Construction Estimate (+/- 15-20%)	\$	44,575,000

The proposed financing strategy, including financing sources already approved by Council, is presented as follows:

Special Debenture (25 years)	\$	20,900,000
Indoor Turf Facility Reserve Fund	\$	10,670,800
Canada Community Building Fund	\$	7,031,200
Renew Thunder Bay Reserve Fund	\$	3,303,700
Synergy North Corporation Note Payable Proceeds (2024 Budget)	\$	1,500,000
Municipal Accommodation Tax (2024 Budget)	<u>\$</u>	1,169,300
Total Financing Sources	\$	44,575,000

Costs for additional work separate from the facility and amenities construction, such as the relocation of baseball diamond and stormwater management, are not contemplated in the above costs and will have to be funded through other City capital envelopes.

Debt Considerations

Through its Debt Management Strategy, the City of Thunder Bay has adopted an overall debt service ratio (calculated as principal and interest cost as a percentage of own source revenue) target not to exceed 10%, with the tax-supported target not to exceed 7.5%. This target is well below the overall Debt and Financial Obligation Limit established for Municipalities by the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing which prescribes a maximum limit of 25%. The City's debt service ratio for tax-supported debt was 5.73% in 2022 and is expected to decrease in 2024 and thereafter remain under 5.17% based on current projections of annual capital borrowing (including the \$15.0 million already committed to this project).

The annual principal and interest payment for the multi-use indoor sports facility Special Debenture (25 years), assuming an interest rate of 4% would be \$1,672,000 in year one, and represent an increase to the municipal tax levy of 0.77%

	Annual Debt Servicing (Year 1)
\$15.0 million previously committed	\$1,200,000 (0.55%)
\$5.9 million proposed	<u>\$ 472,000 (0.22%)</u>
Total Special Debenture (25 years)	\$1,672,000 (0.77%)

If the additional proposed \$5.9 million is included in the Special Debenture (25 years) to finance the multi-use indoor sports facility, the projected debt service ratio would reach 5.34% in 2028.

Considering current interest rates and projected borrowing needs, the Special Debenture would leave approximately \$6,000,000 of annual debt servicing costs before the debt service ratio target for tax-supported debt is reached. This is equivalent to a 10-year debenture of \$42,000,000 or a 25-year debenture of \$74,000,000.

The City's capacity to use Debt as a source of funding for large projects (e.g. Police Headquarters) or to address the capital infrastructure gap (i.e. Asset Management Plan to be presented in 2024/25) within the approved target may be inhibited.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that the proposed financing strategy outlined in this report will support the construction estimate of \$44,575,000 for the multi-use indoor sports facility proposed by SNO, modified to comply with CTB Facility Design Standards.

Administration will report back to Council with the results of public consultation, a recommended project delivery and operating model, and results of other studies and assessments necessary to move forward with a competitive procurement process, in the first quarter 2024.

BACKGROUND

At their March 6, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council decided not to proceed with the award of contract for construction of a proposed multi-use indoor sports facility to be located at Chapples Park (R 9 2021).

A Non-business meeting of Council was held April 29, 2021 to provide background information to Council of their decisions to date in respect of the proposed multi-use indoor sports project, community needs, and Council's approved objectives for the project, project timelines and funding models.

At the May 17, 2021 Committee the Whole meeting, Council directed Administration to report back by June 14, 2021 on an Expression of Interest (EOI) to solicit interest in a potential partnership with the City to advance short and long-term solutions.

At the June 7, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council directed Administration to proceed with a funding application to Infrastructure Canada's Green and Inclusive Community Building (CGIB) Program – Large Retrofit/New Build Category by July 6, 2021 (R 82 2021).

At the June 14, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council directed Administration to proceed to administer the above mentioned EOI and report back on the status and outcome of the EOI by November 30, 2021 (R 85 2021). EOI 02-21 was issued July 26, 2021 and closed August 27, 2021.

At the November 22, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council received an update on the results of the EOI (8 submissions received – 4 long term solutions; 4 short term solutions) and resolved to await a determination by Infrastructure Canada on the (GICB) funding application (R 151 2021).

Corporate Report 335-2023-Corporate Services-Office of the City Treasurer

At the March 14, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council directed Administration to engage with the Tournament Centre operator to maintain the temporary conversion of one (1) ice surface for the upcoming 2022-2023 indoor season, and report back by Q1 2023 on the implications of an extended conversion of one (1) surface at the Tournament Centre (R 20 2022).

At the July 25, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council directed Administration to seek direction from the newly elected Council on a long term facility solution given a response received June 13, 2022 from Infrastructure Canada that the funding application to the GICB program was unsuccessful and given the need for a significant capital contribution from the City to advance the project and the potential that the current Council would be in a restricted acts 'lame duck' position as of August 19, 2022 (R 123 22). This report also provided feedback from key end-users on their demand for indoor sports post-pandemic and their priority needs. The report also provided additional public information on the short-term and long-term proposals received through the EOI.

Given concerns from indoor sports users and the negative implications on ice users with proposed short term solutions involving the Tournament Centre or the erection of an air supported structure over Fort William Stadium sports, Administration did not recommend pursuing a short-term solution other than engaging with the Tournament Centre operator to maintain the temporary conversion of one (1) surface for the 2022-2023 indoor season.

At the December 12, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting, the newly elected Council received a deputation from (SNO on a proposed alternate facility concept to be located on City lands adjacent to the Thunder Bay Community Auditorium.

At the December 19, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council resolved to defer a report to advance a long-term solution expected January 2023 based on proposals received through the EOI process to allow Administration to proceed to explore the implications of the new, alternate SNO facility/location concept. The memo laid out the proposed scope of work to be funded through an appropriation from the Indoor Sports Facility Reserve Fund (\$170,000), and an expected report back date of March 13, 2023.

At the March 6, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, Administration provided a memo to Council on the work completed to date on the SNO option and preliminary findings. The memo recommended Administration proceed with the remaining scope of work and report back in May 2023. Also, Administration advised Council that a funding application for the proposed original facility concept at Chapples had been updated and submitted to the second intake of Infrastructure Canada's GICB program and that Council could withdraw this application at any time.

At the April 3, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council resolved that Administration report back on the costing of two (2) versions of the SNO facility concept:

- one that meets minimum legislated requirements (but not the City's Facility Design Guidelines or Net Zero requirements); and
- one that meets the City's Facility Design Guidelines.

Also, a report back date of September 11, 2023 was confirmed to allow for work to be completed sequentially to avoid unnecessary expenditures should key challenges to the potential redevelopment of the site be identified.

At the September 11, 2023 Committee of the Whole meeting, Council confirmed the lands adjacent to the Thunder Bay Community Auditorium as the preferred site for a proposed multi-use indoor sports facility. The report also directed Administration to develop a proposed financing strategy to support a competitive procurement process to advance the realization of the SNO concept modified to comply with CTB Facility Design Standards and report back to Council by November 6, 2023.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED

None.

REPORT PREPARED BY

Keri Greaves, CPA, City Treasurer - Corporate Services

REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY

Karen Lewis, General Manager – Corporate Services

Date (27/10/2023)



Memorandum

Office of the City Clerk Fax: 623-5468 Telephone: 625-2230

TO: Mayor & Council

FROM: Krista Power, City Clerk

DATE: October 30, 2023

SUBJECT: Integrity Commissioner Recommendation Committee of the Whole – November 6, 2023

Attached to this memorandum is a report from City Council's appointed Integrity Commissioner, Principles Integrity, with respect to the conduct of Councillor Agarwal. This report was received by my office on Friday, October 27. As per Section 236.6 (3) of the *Municipal Act* this matter has been placed on the next available agenda as is my obligation under the legislation.

Publication of reports

(3) The municipality and each local board shall ensure that reports received from the Commissioner by the municipality or by the board, as the case may be, are made available to the public. 2006, c. 32, Sched. A, s. 98.

Within the report is a recommendation of sanction of pay from the Integrity Commissioner that requires Council's consideration.

The Integrity Commissioner will be available at the November 6, 2023 meeting via MS Teams if there are questions with respect to this report and the associated recommendation.

As such, the following is presented for approval;

WITH RESPECT to the Integrity Commissioner report presented on November 6, 2023 relating to the conduct of Councillor Agarwal, we recommend that the sanction contained within the report be approved;

AND THAT Councillor Agarwal's pay be suspended for a period of 30 days (2 pay periods) commencing with the next pay period;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to Council for ratification.

Principles Integrity

City of Thunder Bay Integrity Commissioner's Complaint against Councillor Rajni Agarwal Recommendation Report

October 27, 2023

Introductory Comments

[1] Principles *Integrity* is privileged to serve as Integrity Commissioner for the City of Thunder Bay and for a number of other Ontario municipalities and locally elected or appointed bodies. The operating philosophy which guides us in our work and which appears in every formal communication with our clients to reinforce its importance to us, is this:

The perception that a community's elected representatives are operating with integrity is the glue which sustains local democracy. We live in a time when citizens are skeptical of their elected representatives at all levels. The overarching objective in appointing an integrity commissioner is to ensure the existence of robust and effective policies, procedures, and mechanisms that enhance the citizen's perception that their Council (and local boards) meet established ethical standards and where they do not, there exists a review mechanism that serves the public interest.

- [2] Our efforts in concert with our clients are therefore to help establish an ethical framework through which the public perception of Council is deservedly enhanced.
- [3] The City of Thunder Bay has as part of its ethical framework a Code of Conduct which is the policy touchstone underlying the assessments conducted in this report. It represents the standard of conduct against which all members of Council are to be measured when there is an allegation of breach of the ethical responsibilities established under the Code of Conduct. The review mechanism contemplated by the Code, one which is required in all Ontario municipalities, is an inquiry/complaints process administered by an integrity commissioner.
- [4] Integrity commissioners carry out a range of functions for municipalities (and their local boards). They assist in the development of the ethical framework, for example by suggesting content or commentary for codes of conduct. They conduct education and training for members of council and outreach for members of the community. One of the most important functions is the provision of advice and guidance to members to help sort out ethical grey areas or to confirm activities that support compliance. And finally, but not principally, they investigate allegations that a person has fallen short of compliance with

Principles Integrity

the municipality's ethical framework and where appropriate they submit public reports on their findings, and make recommendations, including recommending sanctions, that council for the municipality may consider imposing in giving consideration to that report.

- [5] It is important that this broad range of functions be mentioned at the outset of this investigation report. Our goal, as stated in our operating philosophy, is to help members of the community, indeed the broader municipal sector and the public, to appreciate that elected and appointed representatives generally carry out their functions with integrity. In cases where they do not, there is a proper process in place to fairly assess the facts and, if necessary, recommend appropriate sanctions. In every case, including this one, the highest objective is to make recommendations that serve the public interest, if there are recommendations to be made.
- [6] Our role differs from other 'adjudicators' whose responsibilities generally focus, to state it colloquially, on making findings of fact and fault. While that is a necessary component when allegations are made, it is not the only component.
- [7] Our operating philosophy dictates the format of this report. The tenets of procedural fairness require us to provide reasons for our conclusions and recommendations, and we have done that. Procedural fairness also requires us to conduct a process where parties can participate in the review and resolution of a complaint.
- [8] In this regard, we have assessed the information fairly, in an independent and neutral manner, and have provided an opportunity to the Respondent to respond to the allegations, and to review and provide comment on the preliminary Findings Report.

The Complaint

- [9] On June 14, 2023 we received a complaint against Councillor Agarwal alleging that she had engaged in conduct contrary to the Council Code of Conduct.
- [10] The particulars of the complaint are that on June 13, 2023, the Councillor repeatedly harassed, and gave 'the finger', to property owners who were carrying out exterior grading work at their condominium property with the knowledge and approval of their property management, purported to direct how they should carry out the work, and invoked her authority as City Councillor to threaten the owners with police and by-law enforcement action.
- [11] The complaint alleges that the Councillor's conduct constitutes a breach of the Code of Conduct.



Process Followed for this Investigation

- [12] In conducting this investigation, Principles *Integrity* applied the principles of procedural fairness and was guided by the complaint process set out under the Code of Conduct.
- [13] This fair and balanced process includes the following elements:
 - Reviewing the complaint to determine whether it is within scope and jurisdiction and in the public interest to pursue, including giving consideration to whether the complaint should be restated or narrowed, where this better reflects the public interest
 - Notifying the Respondent of the complaint against her, and providing adequate disclosure of the information we possessed so that she could prepare her response
 - Reviewing the Code of Conduct and relevant documentation, including a video recording of the event
 - Conducting interviews as necessary of persons with relevant information
 - Providing the Respondent with the additional opportunity to review and provide responses to the Integrity Commissioner's draft Findings Report.
 - Taking into consideration the Respondent's response and documentation totaling 159 pages prior to finalizing and issuing our Recommendation Report. Much of the response and documentation related was irrelevant to our findings or related to technical issues – legal ownership of the development and units referenced in the report, for example – the Respondent entirely admitting to the facts which constitute the contraventions.

Background and Context

- [14] The complainant resides in a townhome at 103 Oasis Lane¹.
- [15] Councillor Agarwal's professional occupation is as a Real Estate Agent and Developer², and she formerly provided property management services for this townhouse complex which she developed.

¹ The complainant, a post-graduate student at Lakehead, and her husband reside in the unit which is owned by her father.

² The Councillor's mother owns 50% of the development company.

- [16] In November 2021, Synergy Property Management was contracted to manage the properties. Property management reports to the condominium Board.
- [17] Councillor Agarwal continues to operate her Real Estate business out of a small temporary structure adjacent to the townhome complex on a small remnant piece of land she still owns.³
- [18] The Councillor also owns three units within the complex, which are rented out⁴.
- [19] Between June 11 and 13, 2023 the owners of a townhouse unit in the complex were undertaking remedial yard work to adjust the grade of their rear yard, to address flooding and drainage issues that occur as a result of improper grading.⁵
- [20] The owners' unit backs directly onto Beverly Street but there is a rear yard fence. The owners arranged to move soil over the top of the rear yard fence between their rear yard and the Beverly Street side using a contrivance which resembled a conveyer of sorts. The alternative would have been to transport the soil through the rear yards of several neighbouring townhomes.
- [21] A trailer transporting the soil parked temporarily on the sidewalk of Beverly Street, while the soil was being conveyed over the fence. The owners secured padding across the top of the fence to protect it from damage during the work. They also ensured that someone was available (near or in the vehicle) at all times, to move it, if necessary.
- [22] Before this work was ever undertaken, the owners sought and obtained the approval of the condominium board in conjunction with property management. No building or other City permit was required for the work involved.
- [23] While the owners were carrying out this work, the Councillor came over to the area outside the fence and demanded that the owners stop the work. From the sidewalk, she yelled over the fence at the owners for undertaking the work, claimed to be representing the City, claimed they were breaking laws, and threatened to call the police.
- [24] The owners informed the Councillor that they had obtained condominium board and management approval to do the work, and that, on the advice of property management, were recording her conduct. They asked that she stop harassing them.

³ This was apparently initially used as a temporary sales office under a permit issued in 2011 however it continues to be operated as the Councillor's Real Estate office, even though the development is fully completed.

⁴ Technically, the units are owned by the development corporation, which is co-owned by Rajni Agarwal's mother, and Rajni Agarwal is the contact for the landlord.

⁵ There is some dispute as to whether the developer may be liable for the failure to address any grading deficiencies.

[25] They proceeded to capture almost 2 minutes of the Councillor's conduct in a digital recording. What is observed is the Councillor yelling at the owner, threatening the owner with the police, and making a rude gesture (the middle finger). A digital image captured in the recording is embedded below.



[26] The Councillor was recorded yelling statements such as:

"Get off here" "Get this off of the sidewalk" "Get it off now" "I am representing the City" "Get off of the road. Get off it now" "I'm not leaving you alone" "I'm asking you to remove this immediately" "You have broken the law. Get it off"

[27] At the Councillor's request, the Police attended on two occasions: the first time, they just performed a 'drive-by' to ascertain whether there was any cause for concern; the second time, at the Councillor's insistence, they re-attended and spoke to the owners, reminding them to be available to move their vehicle, if and when needed.



The Council Code of Conduct and the Applicable Law:

[28] The provisions of the Thunder Bay Council Code of Conduct which are most applicable to the complaint are outlined below:

C. Guiding Principles:

3. Members of Council shall perform their duties in office and arrange their private affairs in a manner that promoted public confidence and will bear close public scrutiny.

Rule 9: Member Conduct

4. Members shall conduct themselves with appropriate decorum at all times.

Commentary

As leaders in the community, Members are held to a higher standard of behaviour and conduct, and accordingly their behaviour should be exemplary.

Analysis:

- [29] A Councillor does not act in a management capacity for the City. A Councillor is not authorized to personally direct the activities of either the City's police or of municipal law enforcement.
- [30] Although Councillor Agarwal claimed that she was "representing the City", a Councillor does not in any way 'represent the City' when they show up at a property and purport to tell the property owner what to do.
- [31] Where a Councillor believes, whether rightly or wrongly, that an offence is occurring, she has no greater power than any other member of the public to 'action' the matter.
- [32] In this instance, the Councillor contacted municipal staff, however because at the time, weekend enforcement was not yet been implemented, the complaint was duly noted and followed up on during the next week. No contravention of any by-law was determined to exist.
- [33] Similarly, a Councillor has no greater authority to direct the activities of the City's police than any member of the public. In demanding that the police re-attend, the Councillor was acting beyond her authority, attempting to exert undue influence and abusing her authority.

- [34] The owners, having sought and obtained the permission of the condominium board and property management, were properly carrying out the work in the manner contemplated. As noted, no City or building permits were required to undertake the work.
- [35] Property management inspected the proposed work before it was started, during the time it was being undertaken, and following completion of the soil transfer, in order to ascertain that all work was diligently undertaken to avoid any damage to the sidewalk, the boulevard, the fence or the curb.
- [36] In short, the work was, at all times, properly carried out and no damage was done by the property owners.
- [37] When the owners were confronted with an irate, strident and overbearing Councillor Agarwal, yelling and gesticulating obscenities, they were not surprised.
- [38] We understand that the Councillor is well-known to them, and to property management, who in January 2023 implemented a Harassment Policy for the condominium as a means of dealing with Councillor Agarwal's pattern of behaviour.
- [39] On June 14, 2023 property management sent a Notice to Councillor Agarwal cautioning that she was in breach of the Harassment Policy and admonishing her to cease and desist harassing the complainants. That Notice reads, in part:

Rajni,

We are aware of the work being completed by 103. They have obtained all the appropriate approvals for the work they are completing..... They have been in constant communication with us in terms of the work they are completing. They are aware that any damage or cleanup required is their responsibility. The parking issues and concerns have already been addressed.

Your actions and behavior towards these owners, however, is completely unacceptable and in violation of the Corporation's Harassment Policy. As a private citizen, you are not permitted to order nor dictate to another owner what they can and cannot do. If you have a concern, you are not to interact with the owners directly. You may bring your concern to Management's attention, where we will then address the issue appropriately. By circling their residence, videotaping them, blocking their vehicle, ushering (*sic*) threats and verbally harassing them, this constitutes as completely inappropriate and not acceptable. If you persist or continue to interact inappropriately with these owners, or any other owner or personnel associated with the Corporation, further action will be taken to hold you accountable for your negative impact on others.

- [40] The Councillor, in her defence, claims that the owners were in breach of the condominium rules and that they were endangering the public. She claims that property management is uninformed, and that neighbouring townhome owners were concerned.
- [41] She claimed that the police ordered them to stop the conveyor they had rigged up, but that the owners ignored the police officers' order. She says the police told her that they had advised the owners to 'stop the unsafe practice'.⁶
- [42] Regarding the 'middle finger' gesture, she claims not to recall doing that but conceded she might have, but it would have been "well after the abusive manner that the owners were speaking and mocking" her, saying that she had no authority to tell them what they could or couldn't do, and telling her to stop videoing them. Or it could have been unintentional, occurring while "waving my hands at them while I was telling them to stop and follow the direction the police had given the first time".
- [43] The Councillor states that she was not videoing them as she does not know how to use the video on her phone.
- [44] She did take several photos which she forwarded to the City Manager and the Manager of By-law Enforcement.
- [45] She claims that, while the sidewalk was blocked with the trailer, a woman in a walker had to navigate around the obstruction, by moving down to the side of Beverly Street. In the Councillor's view, the owners were in complete violation of the By-laws and were impeding the safety of all pedestrians on a busy sidewalk.
- [46] The Manager of By-law Enforcement dispatched an officer the following day, and determined that, although a parking infraction might have existed temporarily, there appeared to be no observable sidewalk or curb damage (aside from historic curb damage likely caused by a snow plow).
- [47] The Councillor's email to staff purports to direct staff to charge the owners:

"I think he should be charged for the damage as he knew after my first warning that he was is in the wrong and he did it anyway." ... "We cannot let people just do whatever they want to do when they want to do it".

[48] Photos of the area show a wide grassy boulevard between the sidewalk and the travelled portion of Beverly Street, with ample room to walk on the wide grassy boulevard around

⁶ The Councillor has advised that she is obtaining the police report(s) which, if relevant, she will be able to raise at Council when our Report is being considered.

the trailer. While navigating with a walker would be smoother by moving over to the paved surface, it does not appear that the trailer created a serious impediment to the flow of pedestrian passers-by. At all times, the owner remained available to move the trailer, if necessary, at a moment's notice.

- [49] The Councillor claims that "this owner has been a problem in the condominium development since they moved in", a statement which is flatly contradicted by property management. On the contrary, property management had nothing but the highest praise for the cooperation and responsible conduct of the owners who are the complainants.
- [50] Rather, Councillor Agarwal, based on the interviews in the course of our investigation, has demonstrated behaviour towards property management, and others, which is abrasive, confrontational and harassing.⁷
- [51] Instead of acknowledging that her conduct and behaviour may be out of line with what is expected, Councillor Agarwal has dug in, justifying her behaviour as warranted, as a representative of the City, in the interest of public safety.

Findings:

- [52] A Code of Conduct provides general and specific guidance to aid members in understanding and achieving the high standard of behaviour expected by the public.
- [53] Codes should be perceived as guides to proper ethical behaviour, and not simply as traps for elected officials. While a toenail over an ethical line would not draw the attention of an integrity commissioner, significant non-compliant behaviour cannot be excused.
- [54] Guidance exists in the provisions of the Code which speak to communication generally, conveying information on matters in an open and transparent manner, allowing the public to view the rationale for decisions, and to treating members of the public with respect and without abuse.
- [55] We find that the Councillor's conduct, in yelling at and harassing the owners and in claiming to be representing the City, was contrary to the Guiding Principles of the Code.
- [56] Councillor Agarwal's behaviour was far from exemplary. It was, in fact, an example of inappropriate interference by an elected official: overbearing, harassing, invoking her status claiming to 'represent the City' in order to threaten and intimidate, and unduly influencing the attendance of law enforcement.

⁷ We will not include details here which are currently the subject of litigation between property management and Councillor Agarwal.

- [57] As noted, a councillor has no greater authority than any other member of the public, even where she believes she is observing a by-law infraction. The most she could have properly done would be to politely ask of the owners whether they had the appropriate approvals to undertake the work.
- [58] Rather, over their assertions that both property management and the condominium board had both approved the work, she escalated her tirade, yelling, giving them the finger, and repeatedly calling out the police.
- [59] Her attempt to invoke her status, or threat of public humiliation, to cause the police to pursue some action against the owners constitutes an egregious abuse of authority.
- [60] We find that her conduct in gesturing with her middle finger to be a shocking breach of decorum. As the Commentary to Rule 9 specifies:

As leaders in the community, Members are held to a *higher* standard of behaviour and conduct, and accordingly *their behaviour should be exemplary*.

[61] We find that her behaviour and lack of contrition warrants the imposition of a meaningful monetary sanction.

Concluding Remarks:

- [62] An Integrity Commissioner's investigation report is not simply the conclusion of a technical exercise to determine whether there has been a breach of codified standards of behaviour. Our role is more than simply the task of bringing adjudication to grievances between individuals. As noted at the outset, we see as our highest objective in concluding an investigation to be the making of recommendations that serve the public interest.
- [63] One of the most important functions of an Integrity Commissioner is to provide training, advice and guidance to members to help sort out ethical grey areas or to confirm activities that support compliance. The Integrity Commissioner's role is as much about education as it is about adjudication, so that municipal government can function better, and that members of the public are able to confidently conclude that members of their municipal council are acting with integrity.
- [64] Sometimes we are able to resolve complaints on the basis of course correction by the Member. Where the Member acknowledges inappropriate conduct and commits to meaningful change, a public report may not be necessary. In such cases, only the complainant and Respondent are made aware of the disposition of the matter.
- [65] However, where a breach is substantiated, and it is important to daylight the concern, the Integrity Commissioner, following procedural fairness, submits a public report.

- [66] In appropriate circumstances, it may be that a Member of Council is able to correct their behaviour. In those circumstances, it is fair to give the Member the benefit of the doubt.
- [67] The Councillor's response to our preliminary findings report makes it clear that the Councillor defends her conduct as justified and warranted.
- [68] She demonstrated a complete lack of acknowledgement that the conduct raised legitimate concerns. She has demonstrated no contrition.
- [69] As such, we believe that a meaningful sanction is warranted.
- [70] The purpose of a sanction is to reinforce Council's ethical framework when education, or acknowledgement, is insufficient. In other words, the Code of Conduct must ultimately have 'teeth'.
- [71] Under the Municipal Act, Council may impose the penalty of a reprimand or a suspension of pay of up to 90 days.
- [72] A suspension of pay does not affect the Councillor's ability to attend meetings and fulfill their duties, but it does take away a portion of their salary, as a penalty for violation of the Code.

Recommendation:

[73] We therefore recommend that Council pass the following resolution:

That having been found in breach of the Code of Conduct, the remuneration for Councillor Agarwal be suspended for a period of 30 days (2 pay periods) commencing with the next pay period.

[74] We will be pleased to be in attendance when this report is considered by Council.



Memorandum

то:	Krista Power, City Clerk	FILE:
FROM:	Leah Prentice, Director – Recreation & Culture Community Services – Recreation & Culture	
DATE:	10/25/2023 (mm/dd/yyyy)	
SUBJECT:	Update – Jumbo Gardens Community (Centre
MEETING & DATE:	Committee of the Whole - 11/06/2023 (mm/dd/yyyy)

This memo provides an update on plans to close Jumbo Gardens Community Centre at year-end as approved by Council in the 2023 budget process (Report 1/2023 Corporate Services & Long Term Care – Financial Services; Memorandum – Report Back with Options to Reach 4% and List of Capital Projects – City Manager).

Jumbo Gardens will cease to operate as a Community Centre as of December 31, 2023, as directed by Council. The savings target of \$10,000 identified by Council will be exceeded in 2024 due to the change in operations for the full year.

Administration has been successful in securing a tenant to take over the Jumbo Gardens facility under a Lease Agreement beginning on January 1, 2024. The new lease arrangement will provide a home-base for a well-established community non-profit sport organization while allowing the current primary user group, the Spinners & Weavers Guild, to continue to occupy the lower level of the facility.

Operating this facility as a leased City asset has several benefits:

- Annual operating and capital cost avoidance
- Continued use by the long-term user group that has specific space/storage needs
- A new home-base for non-profit community sport organization
- Ongoing potential for use by other groups through the tenant
- Increased use of surrounding play fields

- No impact to associated rink that is serviced from the building
- Maintaining and increasing positive presence in the facility and park

The new Lease model will eliminate the entire Recreation & Culture Division annual operating budget of \$31,400 net for this facility. Any ongoing building-specific facility services operating costs will be directly offset by rent and recovery charges to the tenant.

The new model will reduce the forecasted average annual capital renewal costs of \$22,977. The only planned capital renewal work in the next 5 years is the fire alarm system in 2025. The revised capital estimate to maintain the facility in fair condition under a lease agreement over the next 5 years is under \$5,000 per year.

The forecasted annual capital for replacement cost for this facility is \$20,878. This figure is not an annual capital expenditure, rather an equalized value that represents potential future replacement cost and is subject to decisions regarding replacement or demolition of the facility based on considerations such as status of lease, condition of facility, and renewal/replacement costs. Net annual rent revenue will be held in reserve towards future capital renewal, replacement or demolition costs.

In addition to the benefits outlined above, operating this facility as a leased asset avoids negative implications to the current primary user group as well as potential negative implications to the facility and property that may arise from leaving the facility vacant or moving towards demolition once it ceases to operate as a community centre.

Administration will report to Council as necessary with any recommendations regarding the future of this facility.



Memorandum

Office of the City Clerk Fax: 623-5468 Telephone: 625-2230

TO: Mayor & Council

FROM: Krista Power, City Clerk

DATE: Tuesday, October 24, 2023

SUBJECT: Outstanding List for Community Services Session as of October 24, 2023 Committee of the Whole – November 6, 2023

The following items are on the outstanding list for Community Services:

Reference Number (yyyy-nnn- MTG)	Department/Div	Outstanding Item Subject	Resolution Report Back Date - (on or before date)	Revised Report Back Date - (on or before date) (Memos presented at COW updating or delaying Item)
2022-102- CS	Community Services - Recreation & Culture	Affordable Access Pilot Program - Transit and Recreation & Culture	Sep-01-2024	
2022-106- CS	Community Services	Proposed Multi-use Indoor Sports Facility - Soccer Northwest Deputation	Mar-13-2023	Nov-6-2023
2023-002- CS	Community Services - Recreation & Culture	Thunder Bay Pickleball Club	Dec-04-2023	

2023-003-	Community	Soccer	Q1 -2024	
CS	Services -	Northwest		
	Recreation &	Ontario		
	Culture	(SNO) Sports		
		Facility		
		Concept -		
		Review		
		Update -Q1		
		2024 Results		
		of Public		
		Consultation		